# Desk study on the intersection of

# Gender and Disability

in international development cooperation

December 2014

Stefanie Ziegler Handicap International e.V. Leopoldstrasse 236 80807 München





# Content

Acronyms		4
Abstrac	t	5
1. Int	troduction	6
1.1	Objectives	6
1.2	Methodology	6
1.3	Challenges and scope	6
1.4	Structure and content	7
2. Ele	ements of a definition	7
2.1	Gender	7
2.2	Disability	8
3. Ra	tionale	8
4. Ke	y questions	10
4.1	Gender-specific implications	10
4.2	Disability-specific challenges	10
5. O\	verview of policies and legal frameworks	11
5.1	The United Nations	11
5.2	Summary of regional decades	
5.3	The European Union	14
5.4	National legislations	14
5.5	Summary	15
6. Ke	y stakeholders and good practices	15
6.1	Multilateral intergovernmental Organisations	
6.2	Bilateral governmental Organisations	21
6.3	Networks	22
6.4	Civil Society Organisations	23
6.4.1	Women's organisations	23
6.4.2	Organisations specialised on girls and women with disability	24
6.4.3	Disabled Peoples Organisations and Networks	24
6.4.4	Disability specialized development NGOs in Germany	25
6.4.5	Other civil society development organisations	26

6.4	4.6 Human rights NGOs	26
6.4	4.7 Research institutes	27
7.	Summary of approaches and methodologies	27
7.1	1 Specific empowerment	27
7.1	1 Mainstreaming	28
7.2	2 Other approaches	28
8.	Summary of Key Findings	29
8.1	1 Basic Principles	29
8.2	2 Specific methods and approaches	31
8.3	3 Potential fields of action	31
9.	Recommendations	37
9.1	1 Recommendations addressing the political level	37
9.2	2 Recommendations addressing the operational level	39
Anne	exes	41
1.	Terms of Reference	42
2.	Examples concerning the gender gap in disability	45
3.	The intersection of gender and disability within the UNCRPD	47
4.	Examples of gender-segregated disability research and statistics	48
5.	Bibliography	49

# **Acronyms**

BMZ Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung – ministry for

economic cooperation and development

CEDAW Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women

CRC Convention on the Rights of the Child

CRPD Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
DFAT Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, Australia

DPO Disabled People's Organisation
GDC German Development Cooperation

GIZ GmbH Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit GmbH

KfW Kreditanstalt für Wiederaufbau MDG Millennium Development Goals

OECD-DAC Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development - Development Assistance

Committee

SDG Sustainable Development Goals
SGBV sexual and gender-based violence
SV Sektorvorhaben = Sector Programme

UNCRPD United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities

UNFPA United Nations Population Fund

#### **Abstract**

Gender (in-)equality plays an important role in the lives of persons with disabilities and their families. The United Nation's Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (UNCRPD) officially acknowledges the double discrimination based on gender and disability. Consequently, many documents underline the importance of including the intersection of gender and disability into all levels of international development cooperation. But gender and disability are only two elements of intersectional and multi-discrimination: Both interact with other factors like age, income, type of impairment etc., and concern all areas of life. This complexity of human diversity means a challenge for implementing activities of development cooperation worldwide.

As there exist a huge quantity of data and information on disability and on gender issues, the challenge of this study consisted in localising data exactly on the intersection of gender and disability within international development cooperation. The resources and the time allocated for this desk study allowed a limited analysis of existing documents, legal policies and frameworks as well as stakeholders, good practices, approaches and methodologies. Still, further in-depth analysis is needed in order to present a comprehensive picture that goes beyond analysing policies and communications in documents and on websites. The main findings of this study sum up as follows:

- → Concerning legal policies and frameworks, gender and disability are both internationally accepted as human rights issues and each is subject to a UN convention. Currently international law does not directly treat the intersection of gender and disability. Some national frameworks show single elements that consider the intersection of gender and disability.
- → In respect to different stakeholders the document analysed in how far they are adopting a disability and gender approach, by looking at their reflection on disability within gender and on gender within disability, and both in their overall policies/ strategies as far as these were available. The analysis of stakeholders confirmed that few among them address systematically the intersection of gender and disability.
- → Regarding the main approach that development organisations use for achieving gender equality and / or disability inclusion, the twin-track or double approach is the most widely promoted: its two components are mainstreaming on the one hand and specific empowerment on the other hand, with an overwhelming majority of activities on the last. Few other approaches add to these two.
- → The recommendations of this study intend to furnish key elements to German Development Cooperation on the political as well as on the operational level concerning specifically the GIZ Sector Programme "Inclusion of persons with disabilities". Basically the recommendations respect the following approach: assessment of diversity, i.e. disability and gender gaps, plan of action on the basis of the assessment's results with indicated changes and technical support for implementation provided by the GIZ Sector Programme. In order to realistically face the challenge of human diversity and its complexity, the recommendations of this study suggest German Development Cooperation to discuss, promote and develop an operational diversity mainstreaming approach. The proposition intends to initiate a change from a specific approach that centres on one single issue ("disability", "gender", "poverty, etc.) to applying a systematic gender and disability approach that aims at diversity mainstreaming.
- → The proposed key areas for future activities in this respect are diversity, i.e. disability and genderdisaggregated research and statistics, education, work / employment and social protection, health and sexual and gender based violence (SGBV).

#### 1. Introduction

In 2014 the GIZ Sector Programme "Inclusion of persons with disabilities" published a call for proposals for a "study on activities focusing the intersection of gender equality and disability inclusion in development cooperation"<sup>1</sup>. This document presents the findings of the study.

#### 1.1 Objectives

According to the Terms of Reference (see also annexe 1), the rationale behind this study is the statement that "to date, disabilities and gender, as socio-structural attributes and basis for multiple discrimination, have been studied almost isolated. Almost no data and rare literature exists focusing on the differences in lived experiences by women and men with disabilities. Furthermore, only few projects so far tackle barriers in this regard." The purpose of this study is therefore "a contribution to developing methods and tools to effectively include persons with disabilities in German Development Cooperation" by using its gendersensitive results and recommendations "to design sector specific orientation guides for the implementation of technical and financial cooperation." As the GIZ Sector Programme "Inclusion of persons with disabilities" is in its second phase of implementation (2012 – 2015), this study represents a preliminary stage in achieving the fourth indicator that reads "Methods and principles for the gender-sensitive planning and implementation of programmes and projects aiming at the inclusion of persons with disabilities are revised and processed into 3 sector-specific guidelines for technical and financial development cooperation" 5.

# 1.2 Methodology

The findings presented in this document are based on a desk-study that took place from August to November 2014. Due to the enormous quantity of data and information available on disability and on gender issues, and the limited time frame of this study, several chapters and issues still need more in-depth research<sup>6</sup>. The criteria for defining the scope of this study include either the specific requirements demanded of the GIZ Sector Programme "Inclusion of persons with disabilities" within German development cooperation, or follow the implications of the available information. Each chapter explains specifically the choices made and the selections taken. Responsible of the desk-study were several technical advisors of Handicap International, namely Priscille Geiser (Lyon / France), Ulrike Last (Geneva / Switzerland) and Muriel Mac-Seing (Montreal / Canada). Stefanie Ziegler (Munich / Germany) coordinated the different contributions and was in charge of writing the final report; she is also responsible for any inaccuracies and oversights. As a desk study only allows a limited analysis of projects, their impact and efficiency, several examples presented in the document are based on the experiences of Handicap International as these are best known to the authors.

#### 1.3 Challenges and scope

The main challenge of this study was to stay focused on the intersection of gender and disability in order to localise the issue precisely within the huge quantity of information available on both subjects. "(...) a de-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Terms of reference for a study on activities focusing the intersection of gender equality and disability inclusion in development cooperation and the performance of an internal gender analysis (PN 2012.2121.7-001.00); GIZ Sector Programme "Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities", Eschborn / Germany , 2014, page 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Ibidem

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Ibidem

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Ibidem

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> "Methodische Grundlagen zur genderdifferenzierten Planung und Umsetzung von Vorhaben zur Inklusion von Menschen mit Behinderungen sind in 3 sektorspezifischen Orientierungshilfen für TZ und FZ aufgearbeitet", GIZ Programmvorschlag Sektorvorhaben Inklusion von Menschen mit Behinderungen, überregional, PN 2012.2121.7, Eschborn / Germany 2012, page 6

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Chapter 5.2: Summary of regional decades; 6.4.1. Women's organisations; 6.4.6 Human Rights Organisations; 6.4.7. Research Institutes; Chapter 7.3 Other approaches

tailed global picture on how gender and disability intersect is not yet possible as data collection and research has been extremely limited and often clouded (...)"<sup>7</sup>. The study analysed therefore stakeholders and their approach to gender and/or disability, examined gender documents for their approach to disability and vice-versa. The analysis of experiences of disability organisations and their mainstreaming of gender issues, respectively women organisations and their mainstreaming of disability still needs more in-depth research.

#### 1.4 Structure and content

The document presents the content within the following chapters: Chapter 1 gives a short introduction of the objectives, the methodology, the structure and the challenges of the study. Chapter 2 offers elements of a definition of the intersection of gender and disability and chapter 3 presents the rationale behind the study. Chapter 4 explains the main issues and key questions linked to the intersection of gender and disability. Chapter 5 provides an overview of the existing legal framework and policies. Chapter 6 gives a summary of the different stakeholders in the field of development cooperation, human rights through gender and disability rights on an international and, where relevant, on a national level. It also gives a description of existing good practices. Chapter 7 presents selected approaches and methodologies. Chapter 8 summarises the key findings of the study. Finally, chapter 9 provides recommendations generally to inform German development cooperation about the key issues of the intersection and more specifically for the Sector Programme "Inclusion of persons with disabilities".

# 2. Elements of a definition

What exactly means the intersection of "gender and disability" in international development cooperation? Today both, gender and disability are internationally accepted as human rights issues. During the last decades both passed through different stages of evolution:

#### 2.1 Gender

In development cooperation the discussion inspired by feminism centred on "gender", moved then on to "women in development (WID)" within the eighties and during the beginning of the nineties to "gender and development (GAD)". During the noughties and nowadays, the issue of "gender equality" established itself finding its most prominent expression within the Millennium Development Goal #3: "Promote gender equality and empower women". On the operational level the majority of the development stakeholders developed policies and operational tools with a twin-track approach that includes two elements, gender mainstreaming and specific empowerment of women, in order to achieve gender equality. While the empowerment of women has taken place over time, there was no sufficient implementation of gender mainstreaming, as main stakeholders confirm.

A definition commonly followed in development is the one adopted by UN Women: "Gender: refers to the social attributes and opportunities associated with being male and female and the(ir) relationships (...). These attributes, opportunities and relationships are socially constructed (...)".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> The Sexual and Reproductive Rights of Women and Girls with Disabilities, Carolyn Frohmader and Stephanie Ortoleva, 2013, p.3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> "The GAD approach was adopted in 1995 as the official global strategy for promoting gender equality", Mainstreaming disability in development: Lessons from gender mainstreaming. Disability KaR Programme DFID, 2005, p.10

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Tool kit on gender equality results and indicators. Asian Development Bank, 2013; Mainstreaming disability in development: Lessons from gender mainstreaming. Disability KaR Programme DFID, 2005, p.12/13; assessment of gender mainstreaming during the 10-year review of the implementation of the Beijing Platform for Action in March 2005 at the 49th session of the Commission on the Status of Women

<sup>10</sup> http://www.un.org/womenwatch/osagi/conceptsandefinitions.htm

# 2.2 Disability

The way how development cooperation understands disability evolved and is still evolving. During the 50ies development stakeholders had a medical and/or social welfare perspective and the WHO International Classification on impairment, handicap and disability in 1982 was also following a medical and individualized understanding. But still in the 50ies the WHO started to promote a bio-psycho-social model<sup>11</sup> of disability which concluded with the International Classification of Disability in 2002. The WHO / ICF understanding aimed to be complimentary with the rights based approach as promoted initially by the Standard Rules (1996) and with the UNCRPD since 2006. So the conceptualization of disability shifted and evolved during time to be more comprehensive in the definition and operability. As the UN is tasked to promote the UNCRPD based understanding of disability, development stakeholders in the field still use various models and definitions of disability.

Concerning the definition of disability, the UNCRPD refrains from giving an exclusive definition of disability: in its preamble, paragraph (e) recognizes the fact that "disability is an evolving concept" and "...disability results from the interaction between persons with impairments and attitudinal and environmental barriers that hinders their full and effective participation in society on an equal basis with others". However, it represents a decisive step in that it legally anchors a social model of disability, acknowledging the interaction between individuals with long-term impairments and barriers in their environment<sup>12</sup>. This understanding now serves as foundation in strategic documents, such as the World Report on Disability.<sup>13</sup> So while recognising the health related rehabilitation needs, disability studies and the UNCRPD finally arrived at an understanding of disability that does not locate the problem in the person with an impairment, but in the interaction between a person and the environment (institutional, physical and attitudinal). This is the major shift leading to a fundamental change of the approach within development cooperation. Development shifted from addressing the prevention of impairments, health related rehabilitation and "special programs" for persons with disabilities only, to enlarging the scope of interventions towards mainstreaming of disability aiming at disability equality. This is similarly to the evolution of "gender and development".

# 3. Rationale

Why is the intersection of gender and disability an important issue for development cooperation?

First, there exists a huge gender gap in disability: Gender norms and values attributed to women and girls with disabilities vary enormously depending on the cultural context. But commonly "Women and girls with disabilities are (...) stereotyped as sick, helpless, childlike, dependent, incompetent and asexual, greatly limiting their options and opportunities." Another gender inequality concerns the role of women and girls as daily caretakers for family members with disabilities. An additional gender inequality is the fact that generally the percentage of women and girls with disabilities is higher than that of men and boys with disabilities: Global disability prevalence estimates differ considerably due to various reasons; but most documents agree on the fact that disability prevalence within the female population is higher than within the male population. The World Report on Disability for example shows a female disability prevalence rate of 19.2 per cent while it is 12 per cent for men<sup>17</sup>. "Women in general are more likely than men to become disabled because of poorer working conditions, poor access to quality healthcare, and gender-based vio-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Towards a Common Language for Functioning, Disability and Health – ICF. WHO, 2002, p. 9

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> World Report on Disability, WHO / WB, 2011, p. 303

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> ibidem

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> A step forward to the social inclusion of girls and women with disabilities in the Middle East - Multifaceted challenges and combined responses, Handicap International, 2014, p.12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> World Report on Disability, 2011, p. 142

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> ibidem, p. 31

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Table 2.1: Disability prevalence rates for thresholds 40 and 50 derived from multidomain functioning levels in 59 countries, by country income level, sex, age, place of residence, and wealth. World Report on Disability, p. 28

lence (ILO)."<sup>18</sup> But the link that appears between gender and prevalence has not been further analysed yet<sup>19</sup>. Another reason for the higher female prevalence is the fact that "As a result of aging and the longer life expectancy of women, the number of women with disabilities is likely to be higher in many populations than the number of men with disabilities. Many older women who are disabled may lack access to services/support. As life expectancy increases, this challenge will become more evident across more countries."<sup>20</sup>

Second, gender and disability are only two elements of intersectional and multi-discrimination. The UNCRPD acknowledges officially the double discrimination based on gender and disability and confirms that "(...) women and girls with disabilities are subject to multiple discrimination (...)"21. This multiple discrimination is often linked to other factors like socio-economic status, age, ethnicity, HIV/AIDS and others<sup>22</sup>. Among these different elements, the socio-economic status is often key to any development cooperation activities. The World Report on Disability states that "A growing body of empirical evidence from across the world indicates that people with disabilities and their families are more likely to experience economic and social disadvantage than those without disability."23 And the World Bank estimates that 82 percent of all persons with disabilities worldwide live below the poverty line<sup>24</sup>. Studies confirm that "There is strong evidence to support the theorized disability-poverty cycle with 78 of 97 (80%) of included studies reporting a positive relationship between disability and economic poverty."<sup>25</sup> Other sources point to the reciprocal influence: "Disability may increase the risk of poverty, and poverty may increase the risk of disability (...)." 26 "Conversely, wealth and status can help overcome activity limitations and participation restrictions (...)."<sup>27</sup> In combination with the gender gap in disability, girls and women with disabilities are not able to exercising their rights and still today they largely remain invisible in daily life. They do have many issues in common with other marginalized groups and poor non-disabled women, for example "(...) a lack of acceptable collateral, low self-confidence, few resources for business, lack of experience and training, illiteracy, heavy family responsibilities, unmarried status or discouragement from husbands."28

Annexe 2 provides a list that shows examples confirming that the gender gap in disability concerns all areas of life underlining the importance of including the intersection of gender and disability into all levels of international development cooperation. But there is still an insufficient amount of integrated disability and gender analysis in researches and surveys so far. This might change so in the long term, because the Sustainable Development Goals are currently being negotiated. As the Millennium Development Goals left discriminated groups on the margins of development, this new set of Sustainable Development Goals will have to take up the challenge of addressing rising inequalities. Strategies and related information monitoring systems therefore need to address patterns of exclusion simultaneously.

 $\frac{\text{http://web.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/TOPICS/EXTSOCIALPROTECTION/EXTDISABILITY/0,,contentMDK:20193}{528^{\text{menuPK:}418895^{\text{pagePK:}}148956^{\text{piPK:}}216618^{\text{cheSitePK:}}282699,00.html}}$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Cited on the World Bank Website:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> World Report on Disability, 2011, p. 30: The table on "Global burden of disease" shows a more differentiated and lesser gap than the Global Health Survey

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Addressing gender equality in the context of disability, Inputs from UN Women, page 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Article 6, United Nations Convention on the Rights of persons with disabilities, 2006

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Addressing gender equality in the context of disability, Inputs from UN Women, p. 1/2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> World Report on Disability, page 10

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Disability Rights, Gender, and Development: A Resource Tool for Action. Wellesley Centers for Women, 2008, part 3, page 21

The Economic Costs of Exclusion and Gains of Inclusion of People with disabilities. Evidence from Low and Middle Income Countries. Lena Morgon Banks and Sarah Polack - CBM, International Centre for Evidence in Disability, London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine. London / UK, 2014, p.23

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Disability Rights, Gender, and Development: A Resource Tool for Action. Wellesley Centers for Women, 2008, part 3, page 21

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> The Economic Costs of Exclusion and Gains of Inclusion of People with disabilities. Evidence from Low and Middle Income Countries. Lena Morgon Banks and Sarah Polack - CBM, International Centre for Evidence in Disability, London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine. London / UK, 2014, p.8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Gender and Disability: A Survey of InterAction Member Agencies. MIUSA, 2002, p. 60

# 4. Key questions

Looking at the intersection of "gender and disability" in the context of international development cooperation reveals several challenges and key questions:

- What are the priorities to efficiently take gender issues into account in international development cooperation?
- How is the interface of gender and disability characterized for different disability groups?

#### 4.1 Gender-specific implications

Despite long-standing international commitments and the demonstrated benefits of addressing gender inequalities, incorporating gender perspectives into development work remains a significant challenge. The Asian Development Bank acknowledges that despite decades of focus on women and/or gender no sufficient progress has been made to advance gender equality, and more needs to be done in a more systematic way <sup>29</sup>. One of the most important lessons is that actions to address gender inequalities must be explicitly mainstreamed throughout development planning and programming if consistent progress is to be made towards gender equality. Without explicit objectives, strategies, targets, indicators and actions to ensure women's equal participation and outcomes, the needs of women and girls continue to be overlooked<sup>30</sup>.

Many gender activities on the operational level that this study analysed, aim exclusively at the empowerment of girls and women with disabilities. They rarely consider men and boys as possible target group and this on two possible levels: Firstly, due to the mainly patriarchal structure of many societies, situations of male discrimination are considerable scarcer in comparison to female discrimination and there is few data or research available on the subject. So even if these violations of their rights exist, men and boys still are rarely the main target group of "gender activities" within international development cooperation. Secondly, even the empowerment of girls and women often disregards the implication of men and boys as important secondary target group that promotes and catalyses change. To achieve gender equity the empowerment of women and girls needs the involvement of their male family members.

For achieving gender equity the three main lessons learned from gender in development are that

- 1 specific empowerment and mainstreaming as the two elements of the twin-track approach, need both planning, implementation and allocation of funding in equal measures. As gender mainstreaming is facing more challenges then specific empowerment activities, it is essential to (re-) consider gender more systematically and consequently on all levels and throughout the development process;
- 2 gender is not limited to girls and women, but equally concerns boys and men;
- 3 gender analysis is a mandatory starting point.

#### 4.2 Disability-specific challenges

Persons with disability are a diverse group, and shall be respected as such. The UNCRPD recognizes in its preamble "the diversity of persons with disabilities," and article 1 stipulates that "Persons with disabilities include those who have long-term physical, mental, intellectual or sensory impairments (...)" Other articles also reflect this concern explicitly, especially article 3 (principles), article 4 (general obligations) and the cross cutting articles 6 (women with disabilities), and article 7 (children with disabilities). The WHO also confirms that "Disability is extremely diverse" Very different levels of disability related barriers exist depending on the type and/or severity of impairment, resources of the household, and the inclusiveness of

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Tool kit on gender equality results and indicators. Asian Development Bank, 2013, p.v

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> ibidem, p.1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Preamble, (i), United Nations Convention on the Rights of persons with disabilities, 2006

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Article 1, United Nations Convention on the Rights of persons with disabilities, 2006

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> WHO factsheet N°352: Disability and health, Reviewed September 2013

the environment (attitudes, institutions, physical). The lack of accessible information for example means a serious challenge for exchange and participation in development activities. Therefore diversity is inherent to disability, and has to be considered within the already complex intersection of gender and disability. Again, it is difficult to identify specific gender-segregated data on the diversity of disability, but generally the World Report on Disability confirms that "the disability experience resulting from the interaction of health conditions, personal factors, and environmental factors varies greatly"<sup>34</sup> due to different reasons: "Women with disabilities experience gender discrimination as well as disabling barriers. School enrolment rates also differ among impairments, with children with physical impairment generally faring better than those with intellectual or sensory impairments. Those most excluded from the labour market are often those with mental health difficulties or intellectual impairments. People with more severe impairments often experience greater disadvantage."<sup>35</sup> Concerning women with psychosocial disabilities the stigma is very strong as the findings of a study on gender-based violence against women with psychosocial and intellectual disabilities in South Africa show: "(...) women with disabilities, and particularly women with intellectual and psychosocial disabilities, in many instances appear to be so far removed from the legal system (literally and figuratively) that the question of access to justice is not seen as a priority."<sup>36</sup>

Other disability specific implications that affect persons with disabilities in general to participate in development activities apart from communication barriers and the limited accessibility of relevant information and infrastructure, are disability stigma and discrimination<sup>37</sup>.

Concluding, the three main issues concerning disability inclusion in development are that

- 1 understanding the diversity of disability and the different levels of disability-related barriers is key for the participation of persons with disabilities in development activities;
- 2 accordingly accessible information and infrastructure are central issues;
- 3 there is a general lack of disability research and reliable data.

# 5. Overview of policies and legal frameworks

Today, gender and disability are both internationally accepted as human rights issues and each is subject to a UN convention. But "the intersection of gender and disability is not directly dealt with by international law and the time of Conventions directly addressing this intersection and the specific needs of disabled women, has not come yet."<sup>38</sup>

For this reason, the following chapter analyses the main documents of the existing legal framework on gender and disability, to see in what way and to what extent they deal with the respective other subject.

#### 5.1 The United Nations

The **Universal Declaration of Human Rights** coming into force in 1948 claims for "equal rights of men and women" in the preamble and mentions disability in article 25 (1) with regard to being entitled to social welfare. There is no link between the two and both subjects are no cross-cutting issues in the document. Still this declaration is the basis for all following human-rights documents and its limitations are the reason for the development of the subsequent conventions: Since the 50ies, the United Nations have been working on more specific conventions that detail the rights of vulnerable populations like the Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) in 1981, the Convention on the Rights of the Child

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> World Report on Disability, WHO / World Bank, 2011, p. 262

<sup>35</sup> ibidem

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Gender-based violence against women with psychosocial and intellectual disabilities in South Africa: Promoting access to justice. Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, p. 16

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Gender and Disability: A Survey of InterAction Member Agencies. MIUSA, 2002, p. 60

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Discrimination generated by the intersection of gender and disability, European Union 2013, p. 25

(CRC)<sup>39</sup> in 1989 and the United Nation's Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (UNCRPD) in 2006.

Several United Nations' specialized agencies like UNICEF, UNESCO, WHO and ILO promoted the disability inclusion issue over the last decades<sup>40</sup>. In 1990 the Division for the Advancement of Women / Commission on the Status of Women (a subsidiary body of the United Nations Economic and Social Council) organized in cooperation with DPI the first "Seminar on disabled women" in Vienna<sup>41</sup>.

The Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW): In 1979 the United Nations General Assembly adopted the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) and it came into force in 1981. "There is no explicit reference to women with disabilities in the convention means that they are given little consideration."<sup>42</sup> In 1993 the declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women referred specifically to women with disabilities<sup>43</sup>. In 1995 the Fourth World Conference on Women in Beijing adopted the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action that mentions disability on several occasions, mainly together with other marginalized groups<sup>44</sup>. It deliberately included women with disabilities in the agenda of women's empowerment and promotion of their rights. The General Assembly Resolution S23/3 of 10 June 2000 recognised that "girls and women of all ages with any form of disability are generally among the more vulnerable and marginalized of society". 45 The Fourth World Conference on Women in Beijing adopted in 1995 the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action recognizing the specific rights issues faced by women with disabilities, and suggests a comprehensive recognition throughout the suggested actions. The action plan is followed up in a process of reviews and appraisals in steps of five years; today, almost 20 years "(...) after the Declaration, no progress seems to have been made for women (...)". At most, women and girls with disabilities are included in lists of "marginalized groups" without any analysis of their needs and demands or the specific challenges they face."46 2015 will be the year for the 20 years review of the Beijing Declaration on Women in the Beijing Plus 20 consultations. IDA and other organisations are currently trying to give women and girls with disabilities a stronger voice in order to influence the negotiations of this review in Geneva.

The **United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities** (UNCRPD)<sup>47</sup>: After years of discussions, disability became internationally accepted as a human rights issue finding its legal expression in the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (UNCRPD). The United Nations adopted the UNCRPD in December 2006 and it came into force in May 2008. The UNCRPD is the first international legal instrument that refers to the specific challenges of women and girls with disabilities, and recognizes the

44 Report of the Fourth World Conference on Women, United Nations, 1995

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> The CRC mentions disability once and "sex" in the preamble, articles 2 and 26.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> "(...) the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) by providing special education; the World Health Organization (WHO) by providing technical assistance in health and prevention; the United Nations International Children's Fund (UNICEF) by supporting childhood disability programs and providing technical assistance in collaboration with Rehabilitation International (a non-governmental organization); the International Labor Organization (ILO) by improving access to the labor market and increasing economic integration through international labor standards and technical cooperation activities." Mobility International USA (MIUSA)

Building an Inclusive Development Community. A Manual on Including People with Disabilities in International Development Programs. MIUSA, 2003, page 254

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> More details on how Women with Disabilities got on the Development Agenda of the United Nations: http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/enable/women/wwdis1.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> A step forward to the social inclusion of girls and women with disabilities in the Middle East - Multifaceted challenges and combined responses, Handicap International, 2014, p. 37

<sup>43</sup> ibiden

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> "Further actions and initiatives to implement the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action", General Assembly Resolution S23/3 of 10 June 2000, annex, paragraph 63

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> A step forward to the social inclusion of girls and women with disabilities in the Middle East - Multifaceted challenges and combined responses, Handicap International, 2014, p. 37

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> This paragraph was first published in the GIZ Gender Analysis of the Sector Programme "Inclusion of persons with disabilities", Handicap International, Munich / BRD, October 2014, p.9

need to consider gender throughout the document (preamble). Article 1 declares the purpose of the Convention as: "to promote, protect and ensure the full and equal enjoyment of all human rights and fundamental freedoms by all persons with disabilities, and to promote respect for their inherent dignity." Until today 151 countries have ratified and 159 signed the UNCRPD; 85 countries also ratified and 92 signed the Optional Protocol. 49

Certainly all articles of the UNCRPD are relevant to women and girls and the convention succeeds quite consistently in mainstreaming the issue into the whole document; specifically it mentions girls and women in the preamble and articles 3, 6, 16 and 28 (for more details please annexe 3):

Article 3 deals specifically with the equality between men and women;

Article 6 recognizes that women and girls with disabilities are subjects to multiple discriminations;

Article 16 focuses on the freedom from exploitation, violence and abuse;

Article 28 recognizes specific needs for girls and women within all issues concerning adequate standard of living and social protection.

In 2000 the UN promoted eight Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), in order to end poverty worldwide by 2015<sup>50</sup>. In comparison with the different Human Rights Conventions, these goals offer no legal framework; they are time bound political commitments. None of these eight goals mentions disability even though most of them show a close link with disability in general and girls and women with disabilities more specifically<sup>51</sup>. "The 2010 MDG report is the first to mention disabilities (...). The Ministerial Declaration of July 2010 recognizes disability as a cross-cutting issue essential for the attainment of the MDGs, emphasizing the need to ensure that women and girls with disabilities are not subject to multiple or aggravated forms of discrimination, or excluded from participation in the implementation of the MDGs (...). 52 Today, the international discussion recognises the importance of persons with disabilities to be taken into consideration in the post-2015 agenda with a specific focus on women and girls with disabilities: The Incheon Strategy for Persons with Disabilities in Asia and the Pacific intends to ensure a disability-inclusive post-2015 development agenda<sup>53</sup>; DFID proposes a "data revolution" for including a disability disaggregated data collection into the Post MDG framework<sup>54</sup>; statements of IDA on the post-MDG-2015-agenda were inclusive of a gender and disability approach<sup>55</sup>; the Irish GBV consortium published a research report on Gender Based Violence in the post MDG 2015 Agenda<sup>56</sup>, developed for supporting advocacy efforts to place gender based violence response in line with gender in the Post MDG framework, clearly conceptualizing disability in intersection with gender.

#### 5.2 Summary of regional decades

The different regional decades do still need further study; the following paragraph summarises the main issues from Africa, Asian and the Pacific:

The **African Women Decade** (2010 - 2020) has not a single reference to disability or rights of women with disabilities<sup>57</sup>. The African Protocol on Persons with disability is still under development, but the draft re-

 $<sup>^{48}</sup>$  Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and Optional Protocol, United Nations 2006, p.2

<sup>49</sup> http://www.un.org/disabilities/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> http://www.un.org/millenniumgoals/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Disability Rights, Gender, and Development: A Resource Tool for Action. Wellesley Centers for Women, 2008, part 3, page 5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> World Report on Disability, 2011, p.12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Incheon Strategy to "Make the Right Real" for Persons with Disabilities in Asia and the Pacific. United Nations ES-CAP, 2012, p.5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Disability Framework - Leaving No One Behind. Department for International Development (DfID), UK 2014

<sup>55</sup> http://www.internationaldisabilityalliance.org/en/about-us

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Irish Consortium on Gender Based Violence: Gender Based Violence in the post MDG 2015 Agenda. 2012

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> The African Women's Decade. African Union, 2011.

ceived, contains comments on gender inequality to be addressed, as does the Continental Plan of Action for the **African Decade of Persons with Disabilities**<sup>58</sup>.

The **Asian and Pacific Decade of Persons with Disabilities** was launched for the period of 2013 to 2022. In this frame, the Incheon Strategy is currently being implemented<sup>59</sup>; goal 6 is dedicated to "Ensure gender equality and women's empowerment"<sup>60</sup> proposing four corresponding targets and five indicators.

#### 5.3 The European Union

On the level of the European Union gender and disability both take an important place but there is nowhere a reference to the importance of the intersection between both: "The most important tool at EU level at this stage is the European Disability Strategy 2010-2020: A Renewed Commitment to a Barrier-Free Europe, with eight priority areas – but gender is no specific issue." And vice-versa: "(...) women equality legislation (...) does not take the specific needs of disabled persons into account either." For example, the "European Pact for Gender Equality for 2011-20" never mentions "disability" and the "Strategy for Equality between Women and Men (2010-15)" only twice in the context of multi-discriminations.

In 2010, the European Union joined the United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (UNCRPD), the first report by the European Commission was published in 2014. Even if gender is no real cross-cutting issue, the report refers on several occasions to "gender" and "women / girls", chapter IV presents particular "Information on the specific situation of boys, girls and women with disabilities" and many statistics show gender-segregated data. <sup>65</sup> As a consequence of the UNCRPD ratification, national European "legislation on disability is booming in the EU. Multiple initiatives have been counted." <sup>66</sup>

#### 5.4 National legislations

Just as international law does not deal directly with the intersection of gender and disability<sup>67</sup>, there is no evidence of exemplary national legislations offering a relevant framework to address both issues concurrently. While some disability laws make reference to women with disabilities<sup>68</sup>, States usually fail to address discrimination against women and girls with disabilities efficiently. Major recommendations from the UNCRPD committee on article 6 of the UNCRPD point out to gaps in addressing gender as a cross-cutting issue and ensuring equality, in establishing efficient mechanisms to prevent and respond to violence against women with disabilities, or in ensuring participation and representation of women with disabilities in decision-making<sup>69</sup>. Also "(...) antidiscrimination policies in disability specific legislation make no reference to gender."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Continental Plan of Action for the African Decade of Persons with Disabilities 2010 – 2019. African Union, 2010

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Incheon Strategy to "Make the Right Real" for Persons with Disabilities in Asia and the Pacific. UN ESCAP, 2012 <sup>60</sup> ibidem, p.28

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> Discrimination generated by the intersection of gender and disability, European Union 2013, p. 31

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> ibidem, p. 10

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> Council conclusions on the European Pact for gender equality for the period 2011 – 2020, Council of the European Union, 2011

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> Strategy for equality between women and men 2010-2015, European Commission, 2010

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> Report on the implementation of the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (UNCRPD) by the European Union. European Commission, 2014

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> Discrimination generated by the intersection of gender and disability, European Union 2013, p. 29

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> ibidem, p. 25

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> See for example Lao PDR Decree on Persons with Disabilities, article 13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> Based on UNCRPD committee concluding observations on Spain, Hungary, Tunisia, Peru, China, Paraguay, Argentina, http://tb.ohchr.org/default.aspx

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> Disability Rights, Gender, and Development: A Resource Tool for Action. Wellesley Centers for Women, 2008, part 3, p. 28

#### 5.5 Summary

Today 188 states have ratified the CEDAW<sup>71</sup> compared to the UNCRPD<sup>72</sup> with 151 states ratifying. This shows their political will of better including gender as well as disability issues into policies, and laws to affect daily lives of women and men, boys and girls towards disability and gender equity. Still the implementation level of these legal standards stays low, especially in respect to the UNCRPD which is certainly also due to the fact that there its entry into force is 25 years later than the CEDAW. Reasons for this weakness in the implementation of existing legislation are manifold: Concerning governmental institutions and structures, there is often no serious financial commitment from the State, confusion prevails over the coordination and respective responsibilities of different institutions, national authorities lack transparency and clear criteria to set up executive tools.<sup>73</sup> On the other hand, today there are increasing calls for diversity considerations in development (gender, HIV/ AIDs, disability, age) and other factors supporting marginalization.

Concerning the role of civil society the political and organisational weakness of the disability movement is the most evident<sup>74</sup>; internal conflicts and illiteracy have an equally important impact<sup>75</sup>. Generally, representativeness of persons with disabilities and women with disabilities in particular, in public policy development processes is poor. A positive example of participation of persons with disabilities and specifically women with disabilities in a public policy development process presents the cross disability and gender disaggregated rights monitoring done by DPOs in Kenya and Tanzania<sup>76</sup>.

# 6. Key stakeholders and good practices

The summary of key stakeholders only presents a limited choice because a global approach was not possible within the scope of this study. The following criteria determined the selection of organisations:

- ightarrow their relevance for the GIZ Sector Programme within German development cooperation,
- → their potential of innovation for the intersection of gender and disability,
- ightarrow their general importance as global stakeholders.

Generally, the analysis studied in how far stakeholder are adopting a disability and gender approach, by looking at their reflection on disability within gender and on gender within disability; and both in their overall policies/ strategies as far as these were available. The analysis of stakeholders confirmed that "(...) women with disabilities over the world continue to experience serious violations of their human rights, as well as failures to promote and fulfil their rights. Very few stakeholders address the needs and the rights of women and girls with disabilities, while the relevant initiatives remain fragmented and as yet focused on specific regions and areas."<sup>77</sup>

#### 6.1 Multilateral intergovernmental Organisations

Since 2000 the **African Union** (AU) has adopted increasingly a gender mainstreaming method in order to achieve gender equality, with African human rights charters and CEDAW being the reference frameworks. Even though the AU's constitution mentions disability, it however lacks systematic conceptualization as a

<sup>73</sup> A step forward to the social inclusion of girls and women with disabilities in the Middle East. Multifaceted challenges and combined responses. Handicap International, 2014, p. 41/42
<sup>74</sup> ihidem

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?src=TREATY&mtdsg\_no=IV-8&chapter=4&lang=en#EndDec

http://www.un.org/disabilities/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> How can Disabled Women's Organisations participate in decision-making processes? Good Practice case study Niger, <a href="http://www.makingitwork-crpd.org/good-practice-database/search-the-good-practice-database/db/CaseStudy/show/how-can-disabled-womens-organisations-participate-in-decision-making-processes/">http://www.makingitwork-crpd.org/good-practice-database/search-the-good-practice-database/db/CaseStudy/show/how-can-disabled-womens-organisations-participate-in-decision-making-processes/</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> Fact Sheet – The Status of Rights of Persons with disabilities in Kenya. Handicap International and United Disabled Persons of Kenya, 2014. The Status of Rights of Persons with Disabilities in Tanzania. Handicap International, July 2014 <sup>77</sup> A step forward to the social inclusion of girls and women with disabilities in the Middle East - Multifaceted challenges and combined responses, Handicap International, 2014, p.13

human rights and it is referred to as a "special protection" issue only. Concerning the intersection of gender and disability, the AU has started working on the issue with the Banjul convention on human rights<sup>78</sup>; but this document does not reflect issues and problems faced by women sufficiently. The AU then addressed disability within gender in 2003 in the Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa<sup>79</sup>: Article 23 highlights the specific vulnerability to gender based violence and discrimination experienced by women with disabilities due to their stigmatization. This outlines only specific protection needs of women with disabilities while article 2 that defines discrimination does not mention disability as a cause of discrimination. The AU's M&E is in line with the Banjul periodic reports that show the progress for equalization of rights but it remains vague in what the states are to report on (measures, financial resources and other), and hence its action on disability. The AU's gender policy established in 2008<sup>80</sup> has no binding character and reflects only in one paragraph on how women with disabilities are more affected by GBV. When it comes to programming and mainstreaming of disability within gender: The African Women Decade (2010 - 2020) has not a single reference to disability or rights of women with disabilities<sup>81</sup>. The African Protocol on Persons with disability is still under development, but the draft received, contains comments on gender inequality to be addressed, as does the Continental Plan of Action for the African Decade of Persons with Disabilities<sup>82</sup>.

On request of the European Parliament's Committee on Women's Rights and Gender Equality, the **EU Directorate General for Internal Policies** commissioned a study on the "Discrimination generated by the intersection of disability and gender"<sup>83</sup>. This document had the potential to be a landmark, but the conceptualization of gender falls back and gets trapped in narrowing gender down to the impact of intersection on disabled women: "Disabled women are at the intersection of various forms of discrimination on the grounds of gender and disability. This report provides an overview of relevant legislation and its limitations. It examines the ways this discrimination manifests itself in many domains of the private and public spheres. An intersectionality approach is seen as the most appropriate tool to analyse the complexity of this phenomenon and inform future policies and legislation, which will ensure participation and realisation of disabled women's full potential."<sup>84</sup> This document has a high potential of impacting EU policies, affecting development and humanitarian action, as well as reconstruction.

In December 2014, the **EU Foreign Affairs Council** adopted its position on post-2015<sup>85</sup>. Paragraph 19 includes two references to persons with disabilities<sup>86</sup> and proposes disaggregation of data in paragraph 34<sup>87</sup>. The text does not mention disability explicitly, but it refers on several occasions to the notion of "leaving no one behind" as well as to the Open Working Group proposal for Sustainable Development Goals.

EuropeAid Development and Cooperation (**EU DEVCO**) addresses gender in its reviewed guidance note "Disability in development": it encourages country programs to analyse the situation based on disability and gender disaggregated data<sup>88</sup>. It also draws attention to the fact that women and girls with disabilities may face multiple discrimination. However, it doesn't fully conceptualize the intersection of gender and disability, when focusing rather on women with disabilities and disability, only.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, African Union, 1986

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa, African Union, 2003

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> African Union Gender Policy. African Union, 2008

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>81</sup> The African Women's Decade. African Union, 2011.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup> Continental Plan of Action for the African Decade of Persons with Disabilities 2010 – 2019. African Union, 2010

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup> Discrimination generated by the intersection of gender and disability. European Union, 2013

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> ibidem, p.1

 $<sup>^{85}</sup>$  Council conclusions on a transformative post-2015 agenda. Council of the European Union, 2014

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> ibidem, p. 4

 $<sup>^{87}</sup>$  ibidem, p. 6

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup> Disability-inclusive development cooperation. Guidance note for EU Staff. EUROPAID, 2012, p.6

The OECD developed a highly innovative and promising approach for enhancing effectiveness of aid in relation to the reduction of inequality, with a focus on gender and in line with the Paris Declaration, 2005, and the Accra Agenda for Action (AAA), 2008. They developed a "gender module" in order to meet monitoring obligations under these two frameworks and to respond to a proposal set out in the DAC Guiding Principles for Aid Effectiveness, Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment (2008). They also developed "...qualitative and quantitative gender equality indicators to measure progress towards challenging commitments such as country ownership"89. Furthermore they reflected on whether the indicators developed, the data generated therewith, was used to advance the aid effectiveness, gender equality and empowerment of women<sup>90</sup>. Another way to monitor gender equality efforts was the design of gender equality marker<sup>91</sup>. Still, disability doesn't yet feature sufficiently and is hardly a minor issue: The OECD reviewed donors for including human rights in development<sup>92</sup>, and with referring to AAA paragraph 13, disability is mentioned only in link to national policy making and ownership – but the issue doesn't enter their monitoring discussions on the "gender module", the gender and statistic divisions being potential counter parts to further efforts on the intersection of disability and gender. It will be important to engage with and learn from gender experts engaged in the work of the OECD about which policy changes, diplomatic efforts or pragmatic steps are effective (or not) to push gender equality, to avoid mistakes done in the field of disability. For instance, results of the survey in 2011 on gender equality<sup>93</sup> (in link to results showed) show that while gender was included in national policies framework, indicating high levels of national ownership, the results level of monitoring showed that neither donors nor countries had allocated sufficient resource to effect change. Interestingly, while only few country collated data disaggregated by sex systematically, those who did also showed better results in more comprehensible policies and higher scores for budget allocation on gender equality by both countries and donors<sup>94</sup>.

**UNICEF** works in five focus areas<sup>95</sup> and addresses nine topics, of which disabilities is one<sup>96</sup>. UNICEF established a global disability unit which is interlinking with the other units, and promoted disability strongly. Fore mostly, it setup the global partnership on children with disabilities (GPCWD) with 6 task forces<sup>97</sup>. Its global strategy 2014 - 2017<sup>98</sup> provides an understanding of disability in its intersection with gender through an equality approach<sup>99</sup>. UNICEF also acknowledges the need to further strengthen "mainstreaming" and considers the rights of children with disabilities as a previously overlooked topic highlighting that more dedicated capacities are<sup>100</sup>. The strategy specifically mentions the need of children, and specifically girls, with disabilities for multiple pathways. Education is not only the main focus area<sup>101</sup> but also the one outcome area (out of seven) that mentions specifically children with disabilities. In all other outcome areas, where children with disabilities are known to be more vulnerable and to not benefit equitably, they are not

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> Findings from the Gender Equality Module of the 2011 Paris Declaration Monitoring Survey. OECD, 2011

<sup>90</sup> ihidam

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> Aid in Support of Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment, OECD – DAC Secretariat, 2010, p.2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> Integrating Human rights in Development. Donor Approaches, experiences and challenges. OECD, 2013

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> Findings from the Gender Equality Module of the 2011 Paris Declaration Monitoring Survey. OECD, 2011.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> ibidem, p.7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>95</sup> Child survival and development, basic education and gender equality, HIV/AIDs and children, child protection and policy advocacy

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> http://www.unicef.org/whatwedo/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> Child Protection, Humanitarian Action, Education, Nutrition, Inclusive Education, and Assistive Technology; for more information see http://www.gpcwd.org/

<sup>98</sup> The UNICEF Strategic Plan, 2014-2017. UNICEF, 2013

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup> "Gender equality is integral to the Strategic Plan as a normative principle and as a core element of the refocus on equity. As a cross-cutting, structural disadvantage, gender inequality is seen as exacerbating the multiple deprivations faced not only by girls but by all children due to disadvantages such as poverty, ethnicity or disability status." The UNICEF Strategic Plan, 2014-2017. UNICEF, 2013, p. 10

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> ibidem, p. 4

 $<sup>^{101}</sup>$  ibidem, p. 7

mentioned<sup>102</sup>. The future will show how the overall equality focus will ensure an adequate implementation and monitoring of UNICEF's commitment to the most disadvantaged children<sup>103</sup>. The results framework, operationalizing the strategy, is mentioning that the data system of UNICEF needs stronger efforts to become systematic in disability inclusion. Three strategic publications of UNICEF in 2014 display that in the future further efforts are needed to address disability and gender (and other factors) in their interconnectedness more consistently and much can be learned from their approach in education: The latest report by UNICEF on violence against children is not systematically conceptualized as discrimination based on the intersection of age, disability and/or gender<sup>104</sup>. Unlike gender, disability isn't yet a consistent requirement for data collection in its result framework. Its theory of change that accompanies the strategy and results framework, UNICEF acknowledges within education that cross-sectorial linkages and integration efforts for children with disabilities, girls and other disadvantaged groups need to be scaled up in the various output areas<sup>105</sup>. Hence, efficient initial steps are made by UNICEF to address disability in its intersection with gender, age and other factors, with great potential for the other focus areas if they follow path chosen in education.

#### UN Women and the Beijing World Platform of Action for Women

Guiding documents only refer to the CEDAW and MDG, but do not mention the UNCRPD. In paragraph 32 the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action does acknowledge to "intensify efforts to ensure equal enjoyment of all human rights and fundamental freedoms for all women and girls who face multiple barriers to their empowerment and advancement because of such factors as their race, age, language, ethnicity, culture, religion, or disability, or because they are indigenous people<sup>106</sup>. Disability is mentioned once more as additional barrier faced by women<sup>107</sup>. Education is the focus of action<sup>108</sup>. The document refers to women with disabilities always and only in link with other disadvantaged groups: acknowledging their vulnerability to violence<sup>109</sup>, mentioning the need for more programs on economic empowerment<sup>110</sup> and further promoting action to build leadership skills<sup>111</sup>. Disability also finds an interesting mention in intersection with age<sup>112</sup>. However, throughout the programme areas the document focuses on data disaggregation by sex and gender only and fails to mention disaggregation by disability. It highlights the existing gaps and the need for more action on legal education and capacity affecting women with disabilities and their recognition as equal rights holders<sup>113</sup>. The document also emphasizes the intersection between age, gender and disability by highlighting the vulnerability of the girl child to additional barriers apart from gender due to their disability status<sup>114</sup>. The five-years-reviews of the Beijing World Platform however put little attention to the monitoring of the impact of the declaration and platform for action on women with disabilities: it mentions only that many actions targeted different groups and women with disabilities are one of the nine groups 115. The

<sup>102</sup> namely not in social inclusion, health, HIV/AIDS, child protection, water / sanitation /hygiene and nutrition

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> UNICEF strategic plan 2014-2017 – Brochure. UNICEF, 2014, p. 2

<sup>&</sup>quot;And children with disabilities may be particularly vulnerable to specific forms of physical violence such as forced sterilization and violence in the form of 'treatment' (including electroconvulsive therapy)." Hidden in Plain Sight: A statistical analysis of violence against children. UNICEF, 2014, p. 31

Revised Supplementary Programme Note on the Theory of Change for the UNICEF Strategic Plan, 2014 – 2017. UNICEF, 2014, p. 23

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>106</sup> The Fourth World Conference on Women: Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action. 1995, p.4

 $<sup>^{107}</sup>$  ibidem, p. 18

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>108</sup> ibidem, p. 23, 27, 30 + 115

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>109</sup> The document specifically emphasizes that actors need to ensure their access to services and information on violence, and elaborates on the responsibility of all actors in gender based violence have to act in addressing the violence against women, including women with disabilities. Ibidem, p. 49, 52, 54

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup> ibidem, p. 76 + 77

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>111</sup> ibidem, p. 83

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>112</sup> The platform asks governments to take disability and age as important factors into account and ensure attention to "special health needs" of women with disabilities. Ibidem, p. 37

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>113</sup> ibidem, p. 97 + 98

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>114</sup> ibidem. 1995, p. 111

http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/followup/beijing%2B5.htm

plan of action 2004 - 2006 which was supposed to implement parts of the Beijing Platform of Action also does not mention women with disabilities or disability at all. Likewise the political declaration at the beginning of this century ignores the intersection of disability and gender and other relevant factors: Disability is not mentioned once. So with an initially strong start and political commitment to understanding gender and disability and other intersecting factors, the programming efforts thereafter do not match the comprehensive nature of the Beijing Platform and Action Plan on Women. However, the 2013 declaration of women, peace and security takes women with disabilities and their specific needs in GBV response into account, and demands action 116.

The **UN Women Trust Fund** to end violence against women is implementing a donor trust fund of currently 63 Million US\$ in more than 80 countries. Its grantees work mainly in the field of GBV response, preventing violence against women and girls, expanding and delivering critical services to survivors and strengthening the capacity of state institutions to effectively respond to violence. It is a key multilateral grant-making entity supporting efforts to eradicate violence against women and girls in all its forms and contexts, a hub of evidence-based knowledge on what works to prevent and respond to violence against women and girls using a "women-in-development"-approach. It neither integrates disability in its recent publications nor mentions it specifically in its guidelines for application of 117. Moreover, a gender approach in its publications is little visible as it rather focuses on women.

The **World Health Organisation (WHO)** is responsible for providing leadership on global health matters<sup>118</sup>. Concerning the intersection of gender and disability the WHO shows an inconsistent picture. Despite the existence of a disability unit and a commitment to disability, documents of other departments lack the relevant concepts and approaches. The WHO's global disability action plan 2014–2021, defines disability<sup>119</sup> and acknowledges that women may be overly affected by disability due to double discrimination<sup>120</sup>. But the document does neither explain the consequences of this fact for health issues nor does it provide any data. While it acknowledges women's and men's differences this issue does not feature sufficiently in the action and indicator section of the action plan<sup>121</sup>. The document risks therefore to insufficiently addressing the existing gender and disability gaps. Analysing the CBR guideline<sup>122</sup>, a key document of the WHO, for its approach to gender, it appears that the document understands gender as a personal feature equalling it with the biological sex<sup>123</sup>. Moreover, gender is not conceptualized in its link with disability. Since 2012 the WHO started to embrace strategically a gender mainstreaming approach together with mainstreaming disability<sup>124</sup>. The WHO's well integrated gender approach reflects back on the Beijing platform, but even though it was formulated after the adoption of the UNCRPD, there is not a single reference neither to gender nor to women or girls with disabilities<sup>125</sup> which is of concern as the WHO is a key stakeholder in addressing gender

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup> Declaration of women, peace and security. United Nations, 2013

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>117</sup> Call for Proposals. UN Trust Fund to End Violence against Women, 2013

<sup>118</sup> http://www.who.int/about/en/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>119</sup> "(...) an umbrella term for impairments, activity limitations and participation restrictions, denoting the negative aspects of the interaction between an individual (with a health condition) and that individual's contextual (environmental and personal) factors. Disability is neither simply a biological nor a social phenomenon." Disability. Draft WHO global disability action plan 2014–2021: Better health for all people with disability. WHO, 2014, p. 3

<sup>120</sup> Disability. Draft WHO global disability action plan 2014–2021: Better health for all people with disability. World

Disability. Draft WHO global disability action plan 2014–2021: Better health for all people with disability. World Health Organisation, 2014, p. 4

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>121</sup> Only three actions mention gender equality related aspects: training of rehabilitation staff, national data collection systems to be broken down by sex; and caretakers training to take into consideration that the majority are women. The same applies to persons with different impairments facing diverse barriers to access health services and/or have different rehabilitation requirements. Disability. Draft WHO global disability action plan 2014–2021: Better health for all people with disability. World Health Organisation, 2014

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>122</sup> Community Based Rehabilitation. World Health Organisation, 2010

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>123</sup> Two case studies mention specifically women, but not from a gender perspective.

http://www.who.int/gender/about/ger/en/. WHO, 2014

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>125</sup> Disability and HIV Policy Brief. WHO, UNAIDs, OHCHR, 2009

based violence<sup>126</sup>. Also, neither the latest report on the prevalence of violence against women by the WHO does mention women and/or girls with disabilities<sup>127</sup>, nor does the latest fact sheet on gender based violence<sup>128</sup>. One of the few publications outside the WHO disability unit that puts disability in relation with other factors, including gender, is the Disability and HIV Policy Brief<sup>129</sup>. Key policy papers like the CBR Guideline or the WHO World Action Plan fail to describe, analyse and address the link between disability and gender, and forget to recommend how to address gender and disability gaps.

The World Bank's (WB) key objective is to end poverty by 2030<sup>130</sup> with education as one of the key sectors. The WB's "Education Strategy 2020" approaches disability mainly as one issue among other discriminating elements<sup>132</sup> without offering any detailed explanation or an analysis. Disability is neither defined nor clearly analysed in relation to education, and barely features in link with gender<sup>133</sup>. The document integrates gender equality consequently into its system approach linking with the understanding from a MDG perspective<sup>134</sup> with clear data and figures to monitor. This example shows the different handling of disability issues versus gender issues: Gender is an overarching issue<sup>135</sup> and an important topic addressed in the majority of WB documents as it is already visible in the overall infographic illustrating the WB strategy<sup>136</sup>. Also, gender<sup>137</sup> is a cross-cutting "solution area" in respect to global practices like education, governance, health nutrition and population, poverty, etc. Regional offices of the WB are implementing gender action plans. In their latest report on the implementation of gender equality, disability is featuring only once<sup>138</sup>. Concerning its approach and strategy to disability the WB shows a contradictory picture: Disability is featuring in the structure and presentations of the WB as a "topic" 139, but barely in its strategy. In 2014 the WB developed corporate scorecards that are built around the strategic indicators to measure the achievements of their strategy through monitoring its integration in country strategies. In this important document, disability doesn't feature one single time among the impact indicators, while gender (and fragility) as one of the cross cutting issues does<sup>140</sup>. Within their latest report analysing data and surveys on gender, disability appears as a "marker of disadvantage" 141. The WB understands disability here and throughout the majority of analysed documents (except for the disability unit) as an equivalent of impairment <sup>142</sup> and its interaction with the environment remains unacknowledged. This is completely different in the World Development Report<sup>143</sup> issued by the WB in 2012: This document shows a clear understanding of disability in its intersection with gender. The report also consequently presents disability as aggravating the combination of risk

126 http://www.who.int/reproductivehealth/topics/violence/vaw-indicators/en/ . WHO, 2014

<sup>127</sup> http://www.who.int/mediacentre/factsheets/fs239/en/. WHO, 2013

ibidem

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>129</sup> Disability and HIV Policy Brief. WHO, UNAIDs and UNOHCHR, 2009

http://www.worldbank.org/en/about/annual-report/infographics

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>131</sup> The "bottom line of the Bank Group's education strategy is: Invest early. Invest smartly. Invest for all." Learning for All. Investing in People's Knowledge and Skills to Promote Development. World Bank Group Education Strategy 2020. 2012, p. 4

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>132</sup> ibidem, p. 5, 17, 26, 36, 78

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>133</sup> ibidem, p. 16

<sup>134</sup> ihidem n 14

http://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/gender/overview#2: Gender Strategy. World Bank, 2014

http://www.worldbank.org/en/about/annual-report/infographics

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>137</sup> as well as "fragility", "conflict" and "violence" as separate topics

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>138</sup> Only with regards to pregnancy and child birth being the leading causes of death and disability.

http://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/disability

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>140</sup> Corporate Scorecards. World Bank Group, 2014

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>141</sup> "(...) Worldwide, some people are more likely to be disadvantaged than others, and common markers of such disadvantage include being a woman, having a disability, being young or old, and being a member of a minority ethnic group" (Kabeer 2011), IN: Voice and Agency. Empowering women and girls for shared prosperity. WB, 2012, p. 19

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>142</sup> Update on the Implementation of the Gender Equality Agenda at the World Bank Group. WB, 2013. Management's Discussion & Analysis and Financial Statements. World Bank, 2014.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>143</sup> World Development Report. Gender Equality and Development. World Bank, 2012

factors and gender gaps throughout the document<sup>144</sup>. It is also draws attention to the fact that some women are locked into poverty due to gender gaps being compounded with other factors of exclusion<sup>145</sup>. However, disability is not once further described or its conceptual and evidence based linkage further explained from studies or research. On the organisational level, the WB also shows an inconsistent picture: The WB used to have a whole disability unit, but the latest restructuring process led towards having one disability advisor only<sup>146</sup>. This will have an important impact on the mainstreaming approach, the WB originally featured for disability<sup>147</sup>. Mostly, the focus concerning disability and its links is on rather traditional issues as social protection and labour, where disability has been included from the start. But there is little evidence of mainstreaming disability across the sectors, disability rather features as a potential add on for indicators. Since the pioneering first World Report on Disability from 2011, jointly produced with the WHO, the World Bank did not pursue the approach of mainstreaming disability.

#### 6.2 Bilateral governmental Organisations

SIDA, the Swedish International Development Cooperation has a strong gender focus with specific attention to gender-based-violence (GBV) and women-economic-empowerment (WEE). Tools<sup>148</sup> and methods to work on mainstreaming gender exist supporting Swedish Government's "gender equality teams" and SIDA's staff in partner countries. At the same time SIDA does not include an approach to disability within these two focus subjects: there is no specific reference in their GBV or WEE analysis on article 23 of the Maputo Protocol ("special protection of women with disabilities"; other "special groups" are elderly women, "women in distress") on the rights of the women and the one on women with disabilities which are both taking reference to inclusion in economic action as well as protection from GBV.

DfID, the British Department for International Development, presented a promising approach to the intersection of gender and disability after 2005's innovative "Mainstreaming disability in development: Lessons from gender mainstreaming." But during the following years, the issue of disability and gender mainstreaming seemed to have lost its importance until 2013 / 14, when DfID realized that their efforts on the empowerment of persons with disabilities and their organizations were not equal to those in disability mainstreaming. DfID then started to take the leadership with lobby and advocacy initiatives that pushed for high-level hearings on disability. This involved issues like supporting the "data revolution" with the Post MDG framework for including a disability in data collection<sup>150</sup>, as well as conceptualizing disability within DfID's Gender and GBV programing, and vice versa gender in its upcoming disability framework. Following the international development select committee's inquiry into disability and development, DfID has committed to a greater focus on social inclusion<sup>151</sup>. A framework on how to strengthen disability inclusion in DfID's policies, practices and programmes was published in December 2014<sup>152</sup>. Some key issues addressed

\_

Learning for All. Investing in People's Knowledge and Skills to Promote Development. World Bank, 2012, p.23

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>145</sup> Ibidem, p. 27

within the global practice area of urban, rural, social and resilience. The role of this disability advisor is "...to ensure that Bank policies, programs and projects take people with disabilities into consideration." Disability Strategy: <a href="http://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/disability/overview#2">http://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/disability/overview#2</a>. World Bank, 2014

<sup>147</sup> Statement from the World Bank Group at the UN High-Level Meeting of the General Assembly on Disability: http://www.worldbank.org/en/news/press-release/2013/09/23/statement-from-the-world-bank-group-at-the-un-high-level-meeting-of-the-general-assembly-on-disability. World Bank, 2013. Disability Strategy: http://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/disability/overview#2. World Bank, 2014

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>148</sup> Tool: African Conventions, Declarations and Agreements. Swedish International Development Cooperation (SIDA), 2010

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>149</sup> Mainstreaming disability in development: Lessons from gender mainstreaming. Disability KaR Programme DFID, 2005

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>150</sup> Disability Framework - Leaving No One Behind. Department for International Development (DfID), UK 2014, p.6

The Guardian: <a href="http://www.theguardian.com/global-development/poverty-matters/2014/jun/27/disability-dfid-international-development-aid">http://www.theguardian.com/global-development/poverty-matters/2014/jun/27/disability-dfid-international-development-aid</a>. The Independent: <a href="http://www.independent.co.uk/voices/comment/disability-and-development-why-dfid-must-include-those-so-often-left-behind-9520106.html">http://www.independent.co.uk/voices/comment/disability-and-development-why-dfid-must-include-those-so-often-left-behind-9520106.html</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>152</sup> Disability Framework - Leaving No One Behind. Department for International Development (DfID), UK 2014

are education, data collection in and outside humanitarian response work, infrastructure and violence against women and girls<sup>153</sup>, and addressing disability with respect to its intersections with gender and other factors.

DFAT, the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, is the lead agency managing Australia's international cooperation<sup>154</sup>. In November 2008 the Australian Government launched its strategy "Development for all: towards a disability-inclusive Australian aid program". The strategy takes a rights-based approach, is sensitive to the diversity of people with disabilities, gender issues, and focuses on children with disabilities. <sup>155</sup> In collaboration with the Asian Development Bank, Australian Aid financed and published a tool kit<sup>156</sup> to assist development policy makers, implementers, planners and evaluators to ensure gender perspectives are incorporated. It is to help identifying quality results and relevant indicators within the framework of poverty reduction, achieving progress towards gender equality and women empowerment<sup>157</sup>. Disability is systematically mentioned throughout the set of suggested indicators to measure the quality results per gender equality dimension at national or regional level. There are two results in the main body of the tool kit focusing specifically on the empowerment of women with disabilities: One result figures in the appendix that suggests project and program level indicators and it addresses the discrimination of men and women with disabilities concerning their land rights, which is a major issues<sup>158</sup>. The other result proposed focuses specifically on the empowerment of women with disabilities in the dimension of economic empowerment: "Initiatives supported that facilitate women to access decent work (formal and informal employment), including women with disability" <sup>159</sup>. Apart from that disability is not conceptualized and neither are other factors such as social status, location or marital status as a factor to be taken into consideration for indicators, and disaggregation<sup>160</sup>. However, it is one of the most commendable efforts identified by a development actor respecting disability and gender in its intersectionality in a very comprehensive framework for development program management and policy development. For instance, disability is mentioned also under the dimension of "human capital" to ensure the monitoring in how far men and women, boys and girls are benefiting and accessing humanitarian aid<sup>161</sup>. The same is true for the issue of Gender Based Violence, where disability is considered in a comprehensive manner of monitoring access too<sup>162</sup>. It is especially commendable, that this influential donor suggests some indicators to measure the training of education and health staff within GBV responses to respond to the needs of men and women with and without disabilities equally 163. The conceptual framework for gender equality and women empowerment are: human capital, economic empowerment, voice and rights, and gender capacity building. Unluckily, the dimension of strengthening the gender capacity development does not include one indicator or quality result taking disability into consideration. There is therefore a high risk that the quality results mentioned above are not achieved if programs and policies may miss this dimension.

# 6.3 Networks

An example of a research which conceptualized well the intersectionality of disability within and gender equality and empowerment of women approach, is the **Irish GBV consortium**: "The Irish Consortium on Gender Based Violence comprises Irish human rights, humanitarian and development organisations, Irish

 $<sup>^{153}</sup>$  Disability Framework - Leaving No One Behind. Department for International Development (DfID), UK 2014, p. 9/10

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>154</sup> AusAID Annual Report 2012-2013, Australian Agency For International Development

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>155</sup> World Report on Disability, WHO / WB, 2011, p. 264

 $<sup>^{156}</sup>$  Tool kit on gender equality results and indicators. Asian Development Bank, 2013

 $<sup>^{157}</sup>$  ibidem, p.1 + v

<sup>&</sup>quot;Women's and men's rights are protected including poor, vulnerable, and marginalized groups (e.g., female-headed households, ethnic and religious minorities, indigenous and landless groups, and people with disability", ibidem, p. 92

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>159</sup> ibidem, p.36

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>160</sup> ibidem, p. v

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>161</sup> ibidem, p. 54

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>162</sup> ibidem, p. 48

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>163</sup> ibidem, p. 54

Aid and the Defence Forces, all working together to address gender based violence. Its overall aim is to promote the adoption of a coherent and coordinated response to gender based violence (GBV)."<sup>164</sup> The consortium published a research report on Gender Based Violence in the post MDG 2015 Agenda<sup>165</sup>, developed for supporting advocacy efforts to place gender based violence response in line with gender in the Post MDG framework, clearly conceptualizing disability in intersection with gender. It places it prominently on the first page of the executive summary, among other discriminating factors intersecting with gender: "In addition, inequalities and discrimination based on income, location, disability and ethnicity intersect with gender and are often mutually reinforcing."<sup>166</sup> The publication also recommends the disaggregation of any data in GBV responses by disability, and other marginalizing factors<sup>167</sup>. Unluckily it was not possible within the frame of this study to see in how far the programs implemented by the members of the GBV consortium are mainstreaming disability as suggested for the global agenda.

#### 6.4 Civil Society Organisations

The intersection of gender and disability in international development cooperation concerns a huge range of very different civil society stakeholders: Women's organisations, Disabled People's Organisations (DPOs), Disability specialized NGOs, Mainstream development NGOs, Human rights NGOs, etc. Generally, even though there are occasionally cross-cutting and interdisciplinary alliances, few of these civil society stakeholders analysed via their accessible documents at their websites (CBM, LFW, IDDC, etc.) do co-operate systematically regarding the intersection of gender and disability in Europe. The same seems to be the case in the Middle East context. There is an "invisibility of women and girls with disabilities in the work on women, disability rights and development" "In general, programmes focused on gender and development together do not include women with disabilities." In general, programmes focused on gender and development organisations involve actively people with disabilities in their work: "If stakeholders make any reference towards discrimination against women with disabilities, the large majority of them admit that they have no specific strategy to address the needs of girls and women with disabilities and to support them in dealing with the specific challenges they experience, as women and as persons with a disability."

#### 6.4.1 Women's organisations

- $\rightarrow$  "... the women's movement has historically reinforced stereotypes of disabled women (...)"  $^{171}$
- → "The feminist movement has not taken into account the experiences of disabled women (...). The relationship between the feminist and disability movements has been one of ambivalence (...)" 172
- $\rightarrow$  "(...) women with disabilities have been traditionally and continue to be ignored by the feminist movement and women's organisations." <sup>173</sup>
- → Worldwide, disability studies have used a "gender blind approach" (<a href="www.independentliving.org">www.independentliving.org</a>) to examine the lives of people with disabilities and have neglected to explore the influence of gender in the lives of men and women with disabilities. (...)<sup>174</sup>

<sup>164</sup> www.gbv.ie

 $<sup>^{165}</sup>$  Irish Consortium on Gender Based Violence: Gender Based Violence in the post MDG 2015 Agenda. 2012

<sup>166</sup> ibidem, p.6

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>167</sup> ibidem, p.9

 $<sup>^{168}</sup>$  Addressing gender equality in the context of disability, Inputs from UN Women, p. 1 / 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>169</sup> A step forward to the social inclusion of girls and women with disabilities in the Middle East. Multifaceted challenges and combined responses. Handicap International, 2014, p. 38

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>170</sup> ibidem, p. 61

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>171</sup> Forgotten Voices: Women with Disabilities, Sexuality and the AIDS Pandemic, M. Tataryn & M. Truchan-Tataryn, IN: Behinderung und Dritte Welt, Journal for Disability and International Development, 2009, p. 15 - 21

Discrimination generated by the intersection of gender and disability, European Union, 2013, p. 55

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>173</sup> A step forward to the social inclusion of girls and women with disabilities in the Middle East. Multifaceted challenges and combined responses. Handicap International, 2014, p. 61

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>174</sup> ibidem, p. 61

The International Alliance of Women is one of the oldest, member based women organizations, representing women in international organizations. IAW recognized disability in its program from 2014- 2016 only as category for social welfare<sup>175</sup>. Its constitution recognizes the CEDAW as a guidance document, yet fails to acknowledge the rights of women with disabilities as provided in the UNCRPD. IAW's aim is to work for the empowerment of all women and doesn't reflect at all on disability as a factor of discrimination while mentioning other factors<sup>176</sup>.

# 6.4.2 Organisations specialised on girls and women with disability

**Womenenabled international, inc.** is a none-profit organization based in the USA. It advocates for the human rights of all women and girls, with an emphasis on women and girls with disabilities.

**MIUSA** is one of the most prominent NGOs working on the empowerment of women with disabilities for leadership in advocacy and development. As it is originally addressing women with disabilities it now starts slowly to include a gender perspective in its disability inclusive actions. In 2013, Handicap International and MIUSA developed a module on gender and disability in development for DPOs in Eastern Africa, based on both organizations' previous experience<sup>177</sup>.

#### 6.4.3 Disabled Peoples Organisations and Networks

The example of the Middle East reflects the general situation: "the disability movement is fully characterised by male domination and orientation. As a result, if there has been little progress since a decade, DPOs still fail to address the specific prejudices, due to their gender, experienced by women with disabilities. In the same way, the feminist movement in the region, and, in general, stakeholders involved in the empowerment of women, have also forgotten women and girls with disabilities in their efforts to promote women's rights national and regional level." <sup>178</sup>

**Disabled People's International (DPI)**<sup>179</sup> was founded in 1981, with members from 180 countries in seven regions. It is an international network of national organizations or assemblies of disabled people, established to promote human rights of disabled people through full participation, equalization of opportunity and development. It works from an advocacy angle to represent people with disabilities globally. DPI also has two women working groups, one on established leaders, the other on young women leaders. It remains unclear whether DPI works from a disability and gender intersection angle or not: As there is no male working group, it appears to focus more on women with disabilities and disability advocacy. Most of the statements issued are on persons with disabilities, and not taking a gender approach, but aiming to ensure that their programs are gender sensitive<sup>180</sup>.

The International Disability Alliance (IDA) was established in 1999 as a network of global and, since 2007, regional organisations of persons with disabilities (DPOs) and their families. The aim of the Alliance is "to promote the effective and full implementation of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (UNCRPD) worldwide, as well as compliance with the UNCRPD within the UN system, through the active and coordinated involvement of representative organisations of persons with disabilities at the national, regional and international level". IDA, as DPI, aims to represent the voice of persons with

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>175</sup> http://womenalliance.org/action-program 2014-2016. International Alliance of Women, 2014

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>176</sup> International Alliance of Women. Equal rights – equal responsibilities constitution. International Alliance of Women, revised 2010

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>177</sup> Module on gender and disability in development. Handicap International & MIUSA, 2013

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>178</sup> A step forward to the social inclusion of girls and women with disabilities in the Middle East - Multifaceted challenges and combined responses, Handicap International, 2014, p. 14

<sup>179</sup> http://www.dpi.org/aboutus

Durban Declaration. Disabled People's International (DPI), 2011

disabilities at global level. Only few documents of IDA are available online<sup>181</sup>, but statements on the post-MDG-2015-agenda were inclusive of a gender and disability approach. IDA works closely with International Network of Women with disabilities.

The International Network of Women with disabilities (INWWD) is a "group of international, regional, national or local organizations, groups or networks of women with disabilities, as well as individual women with disabilities and allied women founded in 2008"<sup>182</sup>. The mission of the INWWD is the empowerment of women with disabilities. INWWD linked women with disabilities to the Women's Movement<sup>183</sup> and participated in the Beijing plus 15 and plus 20 reviews, highlighting the marginalization of women with disabilities, and specifying that hardly any progress is measured in respect to their situation, despite them being mentioned throughout the 27 priority action areas<sup>184</sup>.

# 6.4.4 Disability specialized development NGOs in Germany

The **Christoffel-Blindenmission (CBM)** is an international Christian development organisation, committed to improving the quality of life of people with disabilities in the poorest communities of the world<sup>185</sup>. CBM strives to remove the barriers that marginalise people with disabilities in the most disadvantaged societies in the world. While emphasizing a rights-based approach CBM is founded on Christian values and focuses on persons with disabilities' inclusion in development and on their access to humanitarian assistance. It works through partner organization and implements advocacy with partners at global level. Gender doesn't feature in the representation of the organizations and CBM does not seem to work explicitly on the intersection of gender and disability in development or humanitarian action.

Handicap International (HI) is an independent and impartial organization working in situations of poverty and exclusion, conflict and disaster. In cooperation with local partner organisations HI works alongside people with disabilities and vulnerable populations, taking action and bearing witness in order to respond to their essential needs, improve their living conditions and promote respect for their dignity and fundamental rights. HI established its gender policy in 2009<sup>187</sup> and is working in several projects and programs through an approach which interlinks gender, with disability (cross impairment, and other subgroupings) and with age. However, the intersection of disability and gender is not yet an overarching approach, visible in its global strategy. Increasingly, HI acknowledges the intersection of disability and gender on several occasions: after starting off with a focal person on gender in 2007, today one technical advisor in the Technical Resources department is dedicated to cross cutting issues of age, gender and other discriminating factors. Moreover, a Making it Work<sup>188</sup> project is specifically looking at good practices in the field of SGBV against women and girls with disabilities working towards gender equity. HI Germany latest statement for the Syrian Refugee Conference, has some gender, age and disability reflections<sup>189</sup>. Further on, latest surveys of Handicap International do present data and research results with a clear identification and disaggregation of gender and/or disability issues<sup>190</sup>, especially in Health, HIV/AIDS<sup>191</sup> as well as in protection /

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>181</sup> http://www.internationaldisabilityalliance.org/en/about-us

http://www.un.org/disabilities/default.asp?navid=13&pid=1514

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>183</sup> Interdependence: Including Women with Disabilities in the Agenda of the Women's Movement - Our Fears, Realities, Hopes, and Dreams. International Network of Women with disabilities (INWWD), 2012

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>184</sup> 15-Year Review of the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action. Comments from The International Network Of Women With Disabilities. International Network of Women with disabilities (INWWD), 2010

<sup>185</sup> http://www.cbm.org/About-CBM-250648.php

http://www.handicap-international.us/about

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>187</sup> Gender Handbook. Handicap International, 2009

<sup>188</sup> http://www.makingitwork-crpd.org/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>189</sup> Presseerklärung vom 27.10.2014, Handicap International e.V.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>190</sup> GBV & Disability Consultancy Report. Handicap International, 2013. Children With Disabilities in Somaliland: A knowledge, attitudes and practices household survey. Handicap International & CESVI, 2013

child protection project, Disability and Rights, as well as Humanitarian Action. HI also developed tools to monitor disability, age and gender equity within HI programming<sup>192</sup> and a focus is placed on the intersection of gender and disability in rights monitoring.

Behinderung und Entwicklungszusammenarbeit e.V. (bezev) is an education and information centre and acts as an interface between theory and practice<sup>193</sup>. While having a rights-based approach to development, the gender perspective is not detectable in bezev's communication and strategy; there is also no reference to the interface of gender and disability neither within the overall strategic approach nor in the guideline for the inclusion of persons with disabilities in development cooperation<sup>194</sup>. But within its regular Journal for Disability and International Development, bezev published in 2009 one complete issue on women with disabilities in the work of international disability and women's rights organisations<sup>195</sup>.

#### 6.4.5 Other civil society development organisations

**OXFAM** focuses on women's rights and poverty reduction, but does not aim on disability as such. Within women's rights there is no visible focus and/or consideration of the intersection with disability. The paper on closing the gap for the post 2015 agenda and gender based violence, doesn't once reflect on the intersection of disability and gender, other than that GBV is causing disability <sup>196</sup>. In its latest report and paper on work on reducing inequality, there is one single reference to disability and no conceptualization of the interconnectedness of disability and gender, in contexts of poverty<sup>197</sup>.

Save the Children frequently considers the interconnectedness of gender, age and disability in its work, but is not consistently in its approach, as the review of some latest researches and reports showed. Disability was included in depth in partnerships with Handicap International for research and guidance in the development of a manual on "Inclusive Child Protection Manual for Emergency Settings", as well as previous research on 'Out from the shadows. Sexual violence against children with disabilities', 2011, which employed gender and disability approaches.

#### 6.4.6 Human rights NGOs

"For far too long, women and girls with disabilities have been invisible, both to the advocates of women's rights and of disability rights, and this has increased their vulnerability." <sup>198</sup>

**Amnesty International** does not have a focus on disability rights within their work.

**Human Rights Watch** is addressing gender and disability in its intersection, clearly formulated in their brief on their work on disability and human rights from 2011<sup>199</sup>. Many of their latest numerous reports tackle stigma related to disability, gender and related violations of the human rights of women and men with disabilities, as well as boys and girls.

Behindertenbewegung. Behinderung und Dritte Welt, Journal for Disability and International Development, 20. Jahrgang, Ausgabe 3/2009

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>191</sup> Gender and disability violence and HIV and AIDS: Triple discrimination against women and girls with disabilities. Handicap International / Mac-Seing, Muriel and Boggs, Dorothy. Inclusive and integrated HIV and AIDS programming. Handicap International / Mac-Seing, Muriel, 2012

rapid assessment tools on gender and disability gaps in GBV response: SGBV against Women and Girls with Disability – First Facts from Dadaab Refugee Camps. Handicap International, 2013

<sup>193</sup> http://www.bezev.de/?L=1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>194</sup> Guideline for the inclusion of persons with disabilities in development cooperation, bezev, 2011

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>195</sup> Schwerpunktthema: Frauen mit Behinderungen in der internationalen Frauenrechtsarbeit und

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>196</sup> Close the Gap. How to Eliminate Violence Against Women beyond 2015. OXFAM, 2014

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>197</sup> Even it up. Time to End Extreme Inequality. OXFAM, 2014

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>198</sup> Addressing gender equality in the context of disability, Inputs from UN Women, p. 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>199</sup> One Billion Forgotten. Protecting the human rights of Persons with Disabilities. Human Rights Watch, 2011

#### 6.4.7 Research institutes

**Center on Disability Law and Policy** and their study on access to justice for women with intellectual disabilities in South Africa

Syracuse University: feminist disability studies

http://disabilitystudies.syr.edu/resources/feministdisabilitystudies.aspx

# 7. Summary of approaches and methodologies

This chapter presents a selection of different approaches and methodologies, development cooperation stakeholders (as described in chapter 6) are using in respect to gender and disability and their intersection. In respect to gender as well as to disability, development organisations declared the twin-track or double approach as their main instrument for achieving gender equality and / or disability inclusion: the two components are mainstreaming on the one hand, specific empowerment on the other hand. Specific empowerment and mainstreaming are presented as two approaches and can historically be seen as two different methods, but it is important to note that while in some understanding of "mainstreaming" it is seen as separate issue, in many of the current ones it is an integral component: mainstreaming is providing the context for the empowerment of individuals.

# 7.1 Specific empowerment

It is certainly widely accepted that the "promotion of gender equality and empowerment of women with disabilities is necessary for the achievement of disability inclusive development."<sup>200</sup> But the overview of this study revealed that only few strategic and political documents exist specifically on the intersection of gender and disability equality. Rather, on the operational level the majority of information refers to activities aiming at the empowerment of girls and women with disabilities only, without addressing mainstreaming components. These activities address all types of disabilities with a tendency to privilege physical and sensorial impairments and a disregard of mental health issues and intellectual disability. They also show a clear priority for girls and young women with disabilities and a lower engagement regarding elderly women. The analysis also showed that men and boys are usually not considered as possible target group and that in two respects: Firstly, situations of male discrimination are considerable scarcer in comparison to female discrimination and there is few data or research available on the subject<sup>201</sup>. So even if these violations of their rights exist, men and boys still are rarely the main target group of "gender activities" within international development cooperation. Secondly, as already described in chapter 4.1, even the empowerment of girls and women often disregards the implication of men and boys as important secondary target group in relation to the interaction with their female family members. But the empowerment of women and girls without the involvement of their male family members makes a real change difficult and does certainly not improve the general awareness and understanding of gender roles and values within a more holistic gender approach that aims at gender equality.

The scope and the type of "specific empowerment" support provided to girls and women with disabilities ranges from the promotion of their participation in specific trainings, events and/or conferences<sup>202</sup>, the secondment of professional staff to specific programme design<sup>203</sup> and the funding of organisational and

 $<sup>^{200}</sup>$  Addressing gender equality in the context of disability, Inputs from UN Women, page 2

 $<sup>^{201}</sup>$  Out from the Shadows. Sexual violence against children with disabilities. Save the Children and Handicap Internationa, UK 2011, p. 12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>202</sup> Gender and Disability: A Survey of InterAction Member Agencies. MIUSA, 2002, p. 56/57

Most "programs designed specifically to address the needs of women with disabilities (...) focused on health and treatment of HIV/ AIDS." Gender and Disability: A Survey of InterAction Member Agencies. MIUSA, 2002, p. 58

individual needs, as well as to outreach activities to identify women and girls with disabilities within the community<sup>204</sup>.

#### 7.1 Mainstreaming

Historically, gender mainstreaming spearheaded the discussion and the implementation of activities around disability mainstreaming. Disability mainstreaming work aims to build on the experiences and results the gender movement had produced. Mainstreaming directly addresses power relations and engages more substantial change in a sector (from planning, to institutional, attitudes, programming and M&E) than a specific empowerment program. This demands concrete resources allocation, but this remains scarce for this comprehensive action. Though sector wide approaches on disability and/or gender mainstreaming are few, inclusive education is an example of what can be achieved through disability and gender mainstreaming. The advance on disability and gender inclusion in this one sector of development cooperation can lead the way, since it embraced most comprehensively disability and gender.

Generally, "mainstreaming" is an approach and not limited to a specific subject. It applies to any crosscutting issue, "poverty" as well as "gender" or "disability". As early as 1995 "the Beijing Conference declared gender mainstreaming as the official global strategy"<sup>205</sup>. The same comprehensive approach was used to advance the discussion on "disability mainstreaming". According to the official UN definition (in ECOSOC Agreed Conclusions 1997/2) gender-mainstreaming is "...the process of assessing the implications for women and men of any planned action, including legislation, policies or programmes, in all areas and at all levels. (...) The ultimate goal is to achieve gender equality."<sup>206</sup> Accordingly, disability-mainstreaming is defined as follows: "Mainstreaming disability into development cooperation is the process of assessing the implications for persons with disability of any planned action, including legislation, policies and programmes, in all areas and at all levels. It is a strategy for making the concerns and experiences of persons with disabilities an integral part of the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of policies and programmes in all political, economic and societal spheres so that disabled persons benefit equally and inequality is not perpetuated"<sup>207</sup>.

Already this theoretical level requires reflections on the details of the mainstreaming approach: who, what, where to. But this is even more true on the implementation level: In respect to the intersection of gender and disability mainstreaming means the systematic consideration of disability and gender - which is the major shift. This should be done in participation with women and men of diverse backgrounds. While as general development organisations may still be far from that, even disability and women's rights stakeholders need improvement: "(...) the inclusion of women and girls with disabilities needs to become more mainstreamed in both the policies and programmes of disability stakeholders and in women's rights strategies and programmes." (for more details please see also chapter 6).

#### 7.2 Other approaches

The European Union deals with the intersection of gender and disability generally in the context of multiple discriminations<sup>209</sup>. Intersectionality is a concept and an approach to policy and programming<sup>210</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>204</sup> Gender and Disability: A Survey of InterAction Member Agencies. MIUSA, 2002, p. 56/57

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>205</sup> Mainstreaming disability in development: Lessons from gender mainstreaming. Disability KaR Programme DFID, 2005, p.12

 $<sup>^{206}</sup>$  From concept to action: Gender mainstreaming in operational activities. UNDP, USA 2000, p.5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>207</sup> Has Disability been Mainstreamed into Development Cooperation? Disability KaR programme, UK 2005

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>208</sup> A step forward to the social inclusion of girls and women with disabilities in the Middle East. Multifaceted challenges and combined responses. Handicap International, 2014, p. 38/39

Strategy for equality between women and men 2010-2015, European Commission, 2010. Council conclusions on the European Pact for gender equality for the period 2011 – 2020, Council of the European Union, 2011. Discrimination generated by the intersection of gender and disability, European Union, 2013

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>210</sup> Discrimination generated by the intersection of gender and disability, European Union, 2013, p. 34

DFID proposes a specific tool that links disability and the DFID poverty and human rights agenda, using the Knowledge-Inclusion-Participation-Access-Fulfilling Obligation (KIPAF) framework as a starting point.<sup>211</sup>

Concerning gender, the German ministry responsible for international development cooperation, BMZ, proposes a third approach to mainstreaming and specific empowerment: gender equity is addressed within the bi- and multi-lateral policy dialog<sup>212</sup>.

MIUSA presents in the survey of InterAction Member Agencies different strategies used to include people with disabilities in development programs: These range from offering persons with disabilities the participation in program trainings, meetings and conferences, making available accessible locations, contacting community members for assistance in locating people with disabilities, direct contact with and information of DPOs, coalition-building and providing financial resources<sup>213</sup>.

# 8. Summary of Key Findings

This chapter summarises the key findings of the study by first focusing on principles that are fundamental to any other recommendation that follows: the discussion on multiple and intersectional discrimination with reference to a diversity approach and the debate on change management. Subsequently the text proposes disability and gender mainstreaming through methods such as promotion and further application of accessible communication and information, the meaningful participation of men and women with disabilities in project cycle management and policy making, and disaggregation of research and statistics for work towards gender and disability equality. The chapter concludes with the proposition of four possible fields of action in respect to the intersection of gender and disability in development cooperation.

#### 8.1 Basic Principles

#### Intersectionality, multiple discrimination and diversity

The discussion on "intersectionality" originated from the multiracial feminist movement in the 60ies primarily as a civil society reflection<sup>214</sup>. It looks into different and combining forms of oppression and discrimination. Accordingly, the intersectional approach to human rights shows the same objectives. Achieving "human rights for all" means consequently the elimination of all types of discrimination. The Ontario Human Rights Commission explains: "(...) as the understanding of human rights evolves, the focus is increasingly on a contextualized approach to discrimination. A contextualized approach places less emphasis on characteristics of the individual and more on society's response to the person." <sup>215</sup> This demands focusing on the impact of the distinction rather than on the reasons for the distinction. In a context of rising inequalities and limited resources, development stakeholders cannot afford to address single issues without an attempt to taking into consideration the complexity of human diversity, because this is essential for efficiency as well as impact. "This requires planners and all development workers to think multi-dimensionally, rather than to categorise people on the basis of single identities, such as gender, disability, urban/rural provenance, or HIV status. We need to be truly committed to diversity and to consider the whole person

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>211</sup> Mainstreaming disability in development: Lessons from gender mainstreaming. Disability KaR Programme DFID, 2005, p. 32

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>212</sup> Gender Equality in German Development Cooperation. Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung (BMZ), 2014, p.3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>213</sup> Gender and Disability: A Survey of InterAction Member Agencies. MIUSA, 2002, p. 26, Table 5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>214</sup> snapshot: http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Intersectionality

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>215</sup> An intersectional approach to discrimination: Addressing multiple grounds in human rights claims. Ontario Human Rights Commission: http://www.ohrc.on.ca/en/intersectional-approach-discrimination-addressing-multiple-groundshuman-rights-claims

(...)"<sup>216</sup> The example of the European Commission shows how difficult it is, to find an agreement to a policy of non-discrimination on the political level: In 2008, it suggested a directive on equal treatment and non-discrimination; today, in 2014, the proposed directive is still caught in negotiations at the member state level. Apart from the policy level, the implications of "human rights for all", non-discrimination and diversity on the operational level of development cooperation remain challenging. Any possible approach needs to find the balance between diversity and specificity. One proposition sees "Creating enabling environments (...) at the core of fostering a non-discriminatory context for equal participation of all citizens in the social and political life of the community."<sup>217</sup> Other important elements may include a discussion on the degree of participation, the level of communication and exchange, a process-oriented approach, and specifically in the context of development cooperation a kind of "Universal Design"<sup>218</sup> of the project cycle making it accessible to all. The intersection of gender and disability provides an interesting base for contributing to the development of a realistic and operational diversity mainstreaming approach in international development cooperation.

The following paragraph proposes a working definition for guiding a diversity mainstreaming approach, adopted from UN ESCAP gender mainstreaming: Diversity mainstreaming, is a process of assessing effects on persons with and without disabilities of all sexes and ages, and other status of any planned action (services, policies any programs), in all areas and at all levels. It is a strategy for making men and women, girls and boys with and without disabilities' concerns and experiences part of the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of policies and programs in all areas. The ultimate goal is to achieve disability, gender, and age equity.

#### 8.1.2 Change management

In order to achieve the final objective of "economic justice and human rights for all" any measure taken and any activity implemented need to aim at a real change of habits and attitudes for more equality of persons with disabilities with specific consideration of gender roles and values. This demands to significantly question existing structures and the functioning of development cooperation' mechanisms at all levels, addressing the formal structures and policies of an organisation as well as its more informal processes. It also means the commitment for and the involvement into a long-term process. Challenging in this respect is, firstly, the given frame and the existing tools of development cooperation that usually works under time pressure within highly complex situations: many projects are designed on short or medium-term with clear expected results, a pre-defined impact and distinct outcomes. But a real change of attitudes and practice would need a more process-oriented approach with a long-term perspective. Secondly, there is the risk of creating resistance when questioning existing settings and power structures with persons who feel not concerned by the issue and are not convinced of the need for change. Here it is essential to find ways of engaging key stakeholders in deciding on and communicating the benefit and gains of the aimed for change that will improve the situation on the long term and create long-term equality and stability. The third challenge relates to those persons who are willing to participate and contribute, but who already face a huge workload and are reluctant to integrate another cross-cutting issue. This "mainstreaming fatigue" is a serious issue, but addressing the intersection of gender and disability with a diversity approach may be part of the solution in terms of acknowledging different intersections, various interactions and multiple identities of people.

Barbara Frost, Chief Executive, Action on Disability and Development, IN: Disability, Equality, and Human Rights. A Training Manual for Development and Humanitarian Organisations, Alison Harris with Sue Enfield, Foreword vii

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>217</sup> Discrimination generated by the intersection of gender and disability, European Union, 2013, p. 10

The WB presents the concept of "Universal Design" or the "creation of barrier free environments as a simple idea: all buildings, products and services should be designed in such a way that the number of potential users is optimized. The need for specialized design or adaptations must be minimized and one simple design that can meet the needs of people of all ages, sizes and abilities equally should be made prevalent." <a href="http://web.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/TOPICS/EXTSOCIALPROTECTION/EXTDISABILITY/0">http://web.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/TOPICS/EXTSOCIALPROTECTION/EXTDISABILITY/0</a>, contentMDK:21150 847~menuPK:420476~pagePK:210058~piPK:210062~theSitePK:282699,00.html#UniDesign

Issues in gender-sensitive and disability-responsive policy research, training and action, Margaret Snyder, Ph.D., 1999, p. 4

#### 8.2 Specific methods and approaches

In order to achieve gender equality as well as disability inclusion, the development process needs a consistent gender, disability and diversity sensitive planning and programming with the aim of equality. In this regard the gender-specific implications include the respect of both, male and female participation and commitment (see also chapter 4.1). Diversity and disability-specific implications for development cooperation include accessible information<sup>220</sup> and opportunities for meaningful participation<sup>221</sup> in all areas and on all levels (see also chapter 4.2). A sound base for this is gender and diversity-disaggregated disability research and statistics that serve as an evidence-based starting point for well-informed decisions in programming and implementation<sup>222</sup>, providing reliable arguments for orientation and for accountability as well as for budgeting future activities.

In order to comply with article 31 of the UNCRPD on statistics and data collection, each ratifying country is to improve the quality and availability of disability statistics. Moreover, the validity and comparability of national disability statistics remains too low. The Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action <sup>223</sup> also encourages relevant research and data collection. The upcoming post MDG framework focusses on disaggregation of data by disability, age, gender and other factors to make sure that nobody is left behind. A key issue is the active participation of men and women with and without disabilities from different age groups in any research activity and data collection. As few reliable data on disability, age and gender gaps are available, more research and comparable statistics are needed<sup>224</sup>: identification of disability, age and/or gender gaps and related access barriers/ facilitators, and identification of equitable health, education, income and/or other societal benefits, between and within groups. The Washington Group's work on national statistics collections to become more reliable and comparable on disability, and the latest work by the WHO and others on a Model Disability Survey offers a frame for the analysis of the general population providing information on the socio-economic status of people with disability that allows direct comparisons within and with other groups. Annexe 4 furnishes other detailed examples of gender-segregated disability research and statistics. Possible contacts and partners in research and statistics are Handicap International's Technical Resource Division for applied researches, Universities like Trinity College with the equitable framework for the health sector<sup>225</sup>, Leonard Cheshire and the University College London (UCL), as well as the London School for Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, DFID, the Washington Group, the WHO and the UN Statistics Division of the Department for Economic and Social Information and Policy Analysis.

#### 8.3 Potential fields of action

The key subjects promoted at international level by the disability movement to inform the operational level of international development cooperation, that have a high relevance for gender-sensitive disability inclusion are governance and human rights, health, education, work / employment, transport and infrastructure, social protection and sexual and gender based violence (SGBV)<sup>226</sup>. This chapter presents a selection of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>220</sup> This concept applies also to illiterate persons.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>221</sup> Discrimination generated by the intersection of gender and disability, European Union, 2013, p. 8

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>222</sup> World Report on Disability, WHO / WB, 2011, p. 46, 80, 83, 121, 226

<sup>&</sup>quot;Improve concepts and methods of data collection on the participation of women and men with disabilities, including their access to resources." World Conference on Women, Sept. 4-15, 1995, *Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action*, 206(k), U.N. Doc. A/CONF.177/20, Annex II (Sept. 15, 1995)

<sup>&</sup>quot; (...) research with emphasis on intersectionality remains overly under-developed." Discrimination generated by the intersection of gender and disability, European Union, 2013, p. 17

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>225</sup> EquiFrame: A framework for analysis of the inclusion of human rights and vulnerable groups in health policies. Trinity College, 2011

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>226</sup> Nairobi Declaration 2014 on the Post-MDG Framework:

http://www.internationaldisabilityalliance.org/en/article/nairobi-declaration-%E2%80%9Cinclusive-post-2015-development-agenda-persons-disabilities-africa%E2%80%9D-8 and the positioning paper of IDA and IDDC: Make the post-MDG framework inclusive of persons with disabilities.

http://www.internationaldisabilityalliance.org/en/millennium-development-goals-mdgs

four topics relevant for German Development Cooperation: health, education, work / employment and SGBV. Each paragraph below explains the rational of the subject proposed, with relevant examples and introduces stakeholders on the international level. Any activity within the four fields proposed should happen in close cooperation with persons with disabilities and their organisations. As a desk study only allows a limited analysis of projects, their impact and efficiency, several examples present the experiences of Handicap International as these are best known to the authors.

#### 8.3.1 Health

Article 25 of the UNCRPD emphasizes the right of persons with disabilities to get the highest standard of health care without discrimination. The Beijing Declaration, Platform for Action, Strategic Objectives and Actions, Para. 109(d) demands to "increase financial and other support from all sources for preventive, appropriate biomedical, behavioural, epidemiological and health service research on women's health issues (...) especially with respect to (...) HIV/AIDS and other sexually transmitted diseases, domestic violence, (...) disabilities, (...) and health aspects of ageing"227. The World Report on Disability states that persons with disabilities have unequal access to health care services<sup>228</sup> and identifies several risks for persons with disabilities: the risk of developing secondary conditions<sup>229</sup>, the risk of developing co-morbid conditions and greater vulnerability to age-related conditions<sup>230</sup>, the higher risk of unintentional injury<sup>231</sup> as well as the higher risk of premature death<sup>232</sup>. The following examples show the relevance of the intersection of gender and disability to health issues: "In certain regions of the world, households spend less on women's health than on men's, given that women's social status is often inferior to that of men and that they have little opportunity to make decisions. Moreover, women with disabilities are among the poorest in the world." 233 "They also relate to many women's lack of education, which makes them unable to gauge their need for care."234 The WHO identifies needs and demands in respect to sexual and reproductive health: "Women with disabilities are not only less likely to receive general information on sexual and reproductive health and are less likely to have access to family planning services, but should they become pregnant, they are also less likely than their non-disabled peers to have access to prenatal, labour and delivery and post-natal services."235

#### **Examples**

- → In Mali, disability awareness guides have been drawn up for reproductive health workers. One of these is entitled: "People with Disabilities and Reproductive Health, IEC Strategy, A Reference Guide" 236. This guide produced by a consortium of NGOs tackles a range of subjects such as sexuality, pregnancy, delivery and family planning. Target population: Women with disabilities, their husbands and the wider community. Another guide has been produced for midwives entitled: "Training Module on Delivering Women with Disabilities"<sup>237</sup>. Furthermore, work has been carried out on the physical accessibility of reproductive health structures. Finally, pilot initiatives have been implemented to improve the financial accessibility of reproductive health structures for all women, including women with disabilities.
- → The article "Forgotten Voices: Women with Disabilities, Sexuality and the AIDS Pandemic" argues that "an integration of feminist disability issues into the women's movement could provide a strong force in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>227</sup> World Conference on Women, Sept. 4-15, 1995, Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action, 109(d), U.N. Doc. A/CONF.177/20, Annex II (Sept. 15, 1995)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>228</sup> World Report on Disability, WHO/WB, 2011, p. 57

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>229</sup> ibidem, p. 58

 $<sup>^{230}</sup>$  ibidem, p. 59

 $<sup>^{231}</sup>$  ibidem, p.60

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>232</sup> ibidem, 2011, p.60

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>233</sup> A step forward to the social inclusion of girls and women with disabilities in the Middle East - Multifaceted challenges and combined responses, Handicap International, 2014, p. 26

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>234</sup> "Gender Inequalities in Health Care," Gender and Health: Technical Paper, World Health Organisation, 2004

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>235</sup> Promoting sexual and reproductive health for persons with disabilities. WHO / UNFPA, 2009, p. 10

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>236</sup> Handicap International Gender Projects at a Glance. Handicap International, 2010, p.2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>237</sup> ibidem

the fight disabled women are waging against HIV/AIDS by exploring the deeply entrenched prejudices that exist regarding the sexuality of women with disabilities and how they exacerbate the effects of HIV/AIDS on disabled women. It discusses how the women's movement has historically reinforced stereotypes of disabled women but also how today there are growing opportunities for cooperation. It is based on a review of a limited sample of feminist disability studies texts as well as the personal experiences and research of the authors."<sup>238</sup>

#### **Proposed activities:**

So far gender gaps were analysed within HIV/AIDS and Sexual and Reproductive Rights, as well as more broadly by WHO<sup>239</sup>. Today, development activities in reproductive health or HIV/AIDS are starting to address also the intersection of gender and disability. Most projects that were specifically designed to address the needs of women with disabilities "(...) focused on health and treatment of HIV/ AIDS." Other health sectors may benefit and learn from this in order to address disability and gender equality in access and health status, for instance, other main stakeholders like the WHO outside the disability unit, the World Bank's health unit, global consulting companies like Future Groups, and main donor countries in areas such as overall health sector improvement, as well as Maternal and Child Health (MCH), chronic and none-communicable diseases, and public health still disregard disability equality in access to health. There is also a disability and gender gap with regards to health insurance addressing additional costs associated with disability and/or higher per capita expenses among persons with disabilities to access health care. Interesting stakeholders in this field are the WHO and the London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine.

#### 8.3.2 Basic education

Concerning the intersection of gender and disability, the World Report on Disability identifies the existing needs and demands in respect to education: It presents gender-segregated data of education outcomes for disabled and not disabled respondents in 51 countries. The analysis shows a clear inequity between male and female students. Statistics of Jordan show exemplary that "the illiteracy rate for women with physical disabilities is the most alarming figure (...)."242 Excluding children with disabilities from adequate education means to reduce their chances of earning their livelihood later on and thus to reinforce the cycle of poverty and disability. "Education contributes to human capital formation and is thus a key determinant of personal well-being and welfare." 243 Relevant initiatives, agreements and conventions like the World Declaration for Education for All (1990), the Millennium Development Goal and specifically Article 24 of the UNCRPD will not be achieved without the inclusion of children with disabilities in general and girls with disabilities more specifically. However, as mentioned above, disability and gender mainstreaming is far advanced in education in comparison to other sectors. Main global development stakeholders in education progress in the disaggregation of data in education, as well as in developing inclusive education policies and programming frameworks.

#### **Examples**

- → At current there is a global campaign to ensure disability-inclusive education is part of the Post-MDG framework
- → The "Education for All"-Movement is a global movement that aims at providing "quality basic education for all children, youth and adults"; it proposes several disability and gender-sensitive goals: <a href="http://www.unesco.org/new/en/education/themes/leading-the-international-agenda/education-for-all/">http://www.unesco.org/new/en/education/themes/leading-the-international-agenda/education-for-all/</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>238</sup> "Forgotten Voices: Women with Disabilities, Sexuality and the AIDS Pandemic", M. Tataryn & M. Truchan-Tataryn, IN: Behinderung und Dritte Welt, Journal for Disability and International Development, 2009, p. 15 – 21

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>239</sup> In their latest fact sheet and with their efforts to disaggregate and identify health gaps more broadly.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>240</sup> Gender and Disability: A Survey of InterAction Member Agencies. MIUSA, 2002, p. 58

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>241</sup> World Report on Disability, 2011, p. 207: Table 7.1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>242</sup> Mapping Inequity: Persons with Physical Disabilities in Jordan. United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Western Asia. 2010. page 38

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>243</sup> World Report on Disability, WHO/WB, 2011, p. 205

- ightarrow The education sector in Tanzania was successful in funding a gender balance and implement inclusive education<sup>244</sup>.
- → The right of persons with disabilities for inclusive education in Morocco (Droit des personnes en situation de handicap a l'éducation inclusive au Maroc)<sup>245</sup>:
  uploads/media/Etude capitalisation maroc web.pdf
- → In 2009, the UNESCO published a guide as well as a toolkit that offer practical methods and tools to make schools and classrooms more inclusive, learning-friendly and gender-sensitive: "Teaching Children with Disabilities in Inclusive Settings. Embracing Diversity: Guide / Toolkit for Creating Inclusive, Learning-friendly Environments." Bangkok / Thailand 2009
- → A good example of mainstreaming children with disabilities in regular schools is the Arab Episcopal School: "In 2010/2011, the total number of students is 148 (79 boys and 69 girls), including 34 blind and low-vision students, 18 of which are girls. Four blind teachers are currently teaching in this school, and one sighted teacher can teach and read Braille." For more details please see <a href="http://www.aeschool.org/en/content/history">http://www.aeschool.org/en/content/history</a>

#### **Proposed activities:**

Join and support a global movement by promoting gender and disability disaggregated data collection systems in the education sector: While UNICEF and the World Bank are working on disability inclusive data collection, the currently existing data collection systems promoted through the development framework in the education sector (Education Management and Information Systems) are inclusive of gender and less inclusive of disability disaggregation. Strengthen the application of the barrier and facilitator assessment action started by UNICEF to be promoted to other actors to ensure gender and disability sensitive assessment of the education environment. Promote sector wide education systems transformation towards gender and disability equality inclusion (from curriculum, statistics, teacher training, to education policies), within German Development Cooperation in general and GIZ education sector support programs more specifically. Interesting stakeholders are, as already mentioned above, UNICEF and the World Bank, Leeds University with a focus on Inclusive Education in Development, Handicap International, Sight Savers International, Light for the World, and Enabling Education Network (EENET) on the civil society level.

#### 8.3.3 Work / employment and social protection

Article 27 of the UNCRPD states the right of persons with disabilities to work. Certainly, women and men with disabilities who are able to earn their livelihood and/or have access to social safety nets (if unable to earn an income) will have more chances of breaking the cycle of poverty and disability. In low-income countries, the main opportunity for persons with disabilities to earn a livelihood is self-employment in informal economies<sup>247</sup> with a high percentage of women in "vulnerable employment"<sup>248</sup>. On the level of the national economy, the participation of people with disabilities in the labour force is important for maximizing human resources: it increases the personal well-being and welfare and contributes to the national output<sup>249</sup>. Concerning the intersection of gender and disability, the World Health Survey identified the existing needs and demands: The analysis of 51 countries shows employment rates of 52.8% for men with disability, 19.6% for women with disability, compared with 64.9% for non-disabled men, and 29.9% for non-disabled

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>244</sup> The successful education sector development in Tanzania: Comment on gender balance and inclusive education. University of Jyväskylä, 2010

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>245</sup> Collectif pour la promotion des droits des personnes en situation de handicap au Maroc / Handicap International – Programme Maghreb

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>246</sup> A step forward to the social inclusion of girls and women with disabilities in the Middle East - Multifaceted challenges and combined responses. Handicap International, 2014, p. 58/59

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>247</sup> The employment situation of people with disabilities: towards improved statistical information. ILO, 2007, p.26 and 29. <a href="http://www.handicap-international.org.uk/what\_we\_do/inclusion/economic\_inclusion">http://www.handicap-international.org.uk/what\_we\_do/inclusion/economic\_inclusion</a>. World Report on Disability, WHO/WB, 2011, p. 236.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>248</sup> "The share of women in vulnerable employment, at 50.5 per cent, exceeds the corresponding share for men (48.2)". ILO, 2012, p.44

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>249</sup> World Report on Disability, WHO/WB, 2011, p. 236

women<sup>250</sup>. The social and economic costs of exclusion and the gains of disability inclusion on a general level and more specifically on the level of women and girls with disabilities are a stake at risk<sup>251</sup>. The World Report on Disability confirms that "the economic and social costs of disability are significant, but difficult to quantify."<sup>252</sup> Consequently, no reliable data exists concerning specifically the costs of excluding girls and women with disabilities<sup>253</sup>. A latest report by the ILO on social protection schemes emphasises the need to integrate a balanced system of employment incentives for persons with disabilities, incentives and support to private businesses to become inclusive and provide reasonable accommodation in complementarity to sheltered work and social protection schemes<sup>254</sup>.

#### **Examples**

- → The ILO implemented, with the support of the Government of Ireland, an innovative project "Count us in! Developing Entrepreneurship among Women with Disabilities" that provides training in microenterprise skill to women with disabilities in Ethiopia, Kenya, Tanzania, Uganda and Zambia. The project supports them in starting business activities through partnership with local NGOs and microfinance institutions. It involves DPOs as well as mainstream organisations (Women Entrepreneurs' Associations and Women's Enterprises Associations. The project supports the project su
- → "In 2004, the Lebanese Physical Handicapped Union (LPHU) developed a five-year plan, which focused on the "bread-and-butter" issues of education and labour. Even though Law 220/2000 on the rights of people with disabilities remained largely unimplemented, the LPHU built its plan on a solid foundation of scientific research and field surveys, more particularly in the poorest and highly marginalized Lebanese regions. Capitalizing on these studies, LPHU designed a series of programmes with people with disabilities, who account for more than ten percent of the population, their families, the private sector, technical institutes, universities and civil society groups for the Bekaa governorate. This effectively opened communication channels between persons with disabilities and society to promote their economic and social inclusion."<sup>257</sup>
- → Handicap International did a global survey and interviews with 107 organisations of/for people with disabilities and microfinance providers. "A major finding of the study was that people with disabilities are highly underrepresented among the clients of microfinance institutions." Interestingly, 54% of the programmes of microfinance institutions target both men and women while 46% responded that they prioritised women (although men are not excluded), with female members representing 63–95% 259.
- → ILO Global Business and Disability Network developed an online self-assessment tool that assists employers in assessing their current disability inclusion policies and practices: <a href="http://www.businessanddisability.org/index.php?lang=en">http://www.businessanddisability.org/index.php?lang=en</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>250</sup> World Health Survey (http://www.who.int/healthinfo/survey/en), cited IN: World Report on Disability, 2011, p.237

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>251</sup> World Report on Disability, WHO/WB, 2011, p. 205

ibidem, p.42: It lists the "cost of productivity losses because of disability, the cost of lost taxes because of nonemployment or reduced employment of disabled people, the cost of health care, social protection, and labour market programmes, and the cost of reasonable accommodation."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>253</sup> ibidem, p.42

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>254</sup> World Social Protection Report. Building economic recovery, inlusive development and social justice. 2014-2015. ILO, 2014

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>255</sup> Disability Discrimination at Work Fact Sheet, ILO, 2008, p.2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>256</sup> A step forward to the social inclusion of girls and women with disabilities in the Middle East. Multifaceted challenges and combined responses. Handicap International, 2014, p. 38, Box 6

Access to Social Services for Persons with Disabilities in the Middle East, Multi-stakeholder reflections for policy reform. Disability Monitor Initiative-Middle East, 2009, p. 157.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>258</sup> Good Practices for the Economic Inclusion of People with Disabilities in Developing Countries: Funding Mechanisms for Self-Employment. Handicap International, 2006, p.3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>259</sup> ibidem, p. 102

#### **Proposed activities:**

Sustainable livelihoods consist of several key elements: the livelihood planning process, the improvement and development of skills, the access to microfinance activities and to waged employment. Most of the analysed examples concern skills improvement and only few micro-finance activities and waged employment. Many examples focus on the specific empowerment of women, some showed the mainstreaming of the intersection into general activities and none included the involvement of the (male) environment into the support of their (female) family members. The mainstreaming of the intersection of gender and disability into existing livelihood, social protection and micro-finances activities on all levels of German Development Cooperation appears as a promising approach, because many stakeholders in this field and specifically microfinance institutions are already aware and respect gender issues<sup>260</sup>. Interesting stakeholders are ILO, Tricle Up<sup>261</sup> and Handicap International. An exchange with UNESCO UNEVOC based in Bonn may identify opportunities for sensitisation on the importance of the intersection of gender and disability and even for mainstreaming it into their project portfolios.

#### 8.3.4 Sexual and gender based violence

The preamble of the UNCRPD recognises in its preamble (q) "that women and girls with disabilities are often at greater risk, both within and outside the home, of violence, injury or abuse, neglect or negligent treatment, maltreatment or exploitation". The UNFPA estimates that persons with disabilities are up to three times more likely to be victims of physical and sexual abuse and rape. Boys/men and girls/women with intellectual impairments were thought to be particularly vulnerable to SGBV<sup>263</sup>. "(...) small-scale studies (...) from low-income and middle-income countries emphasise the vulnerability of people with disabilities to violence, particularly women (...)<sup>264</sup>. "Being young and a girl/woman puts a person with disability at increased risk of SGBV". The subject is increasingly discussed on different international events and a variety of key stakeholders, i.e. IDA and Human Rights Watch collaborated for a side event on violence and women with disabilities, in Geneva in September 2014. Unluckily "There appears to be little interaction between disability organisations and gender-based violence organisations."

#### **Examples**

- → Liza B. Martinez describes in her article how "Advocacy in the area of sexual abuse among deaf Filipinas has progressed in the past decade because of front-lining deaf organization involvement in partnership with other NGOs." Her article "reviews recent milestones and examines this in the context of multidimensional membership and relationships of deaf women in different sectors separated by gender, disability, community and culture.
- → Making it Work (MiW) is a methodology for documenting good practices on the inclusion of people with disabilities and for analysing how these positive changes could be replicated or sustained. Handicap International developed Making it Work in collaboration with partners over the last five years. This methodology has been used to implement projects in over 25 countries by more than 60 different or-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>260</sup> Good Practices for the Economic Inclusion of People with Disabilities in Developing Countries: Funding Mechanisms for Self-Employment. Handicap International, 2006, p. 102

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>261</sup> Disability, Poverty & Livelihoods - Guidance from Trickle Up. Trickle Up, 2013

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>262</sup> Disability Rights, Gender, and Development. A Resource Tool for Action. WCW, 2008. Part 2, page 9

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>263</sup> An assessment of the factors of risk and vulnerability of women and men with disabilities to sexual and gender-based violence. Handicap International Rwanda, 2012, p.9

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>264</sup> Prevalence and risk of violence against adults with Disabilities: a systematic review and meta-analysis of observational studies, WHO / JMU, 2012, p.10

An assessment of the factors of risk and vulnerability of women and men with disabilities to sexual and gender-based violence, Handicap International Rwanda, Satellite Document, Research and Studies Collection, 2012, p.9

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>266</sup> Gender-based violence against women with psychosocial and intellectual disabilities in South Africa: Promoting access to justice. Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, p. 18

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>267</sup> Advocacy for and by Deaf Women: Observations on Gender & Disability Movements in the Philippines, Liza B. Martinez. IN: Behinderung und Dritte Welt, Journal for Disability and International Development, 2009, p.4

ganizations on many of the topics covered by the UNCRPD (...)."<sup>268</sup> This initiative acknowledges the vulnerability of women and girls with disabilities to gender and disability-based violence and the lack of documented good practices around inclusive responses."<sup>269</sup> In May 2014, the Advisory Committee launched an International Call for Good Practices on the elimination and prevention of and response to violence, abuse and exploitation of women and girls with disabilities that have successfully addressed or shown progress in eliminating, preventing or responding to abuse, exploitation and violence against women and girls with disabilities. (...) The Advisory Committee reviewed over 40 proposals submitted in response to the International Call and selected 12 for further study. These practices have been selected based on their potential to raise awareness, inform international level advocacy, and build the capacity of women and girls with disabilities and their organizations from across South, Central, and North America as well as Asia, the Middle East and Africa."

## **Proposed activities:**

Activities within the first three potential fields of action (health, education, work / employment) concern the sources and causes of gender and disability inequalities. In comparison, SGBV is a subject that shows the effects of these inequalities and other risk factors contributing to unequal power relations and exposure to SGBV. The promotion of the documentation of good practices for informed decision making and evidence-based advocacy and programming therefore appears as the most important field of activity. Relevant stakeholders are UN WOMEN, DFAT (see 6.2), the Irish GBV Consortium (see 6.3) and the Making-it-Work Initiative mentioned above.

# 9. Recommendations

This chapter proposes recommendations for German Development Cooperation on the political as well as on the operational level. This last section concerns specifically the GIZ Sector Programme "Inclusion of persons with disabilities" with the objective of contributing to the development of gender-sensitive tools and methods to effectively include persons with disabilities into German Development Cooperation. It supports the design of "three sector specific orientation guides for the implementation of technical and financial cooperation" and contributes to achieving the fourth indicator of the Sector Programme. The recommendations translate the basic principles in chapter 8.1, the specific methods and approaches in chapter 8.2 and the four potential fields of action in chapter 8.3 into concrete activities for the respective stakeholders.

# 9.1 Recommendations addressing the political level

Research and data collection:

- → Encourage systematic sex, gender and diversity disaggregated data collection in education, work / employment, human rights, governance, health and in sexual and gender based violence. A key issue is the active participation of persons with disabilities and their representative organisations in any research activity and data collection.
- → Engagement of DPOs may need specific empowerment and capacity development action in this field, to allow DPOs and persons with disabilities to develop their capacity on data and statistic collection, analysis and usage to provide informed input.
- → Promote the application for programming and policy making as well as accessibility of research data and statistics and disseminate widely.

Discrimination and diversity:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>268</sup> www.makingitwork-crpd.org

Gender and Disability Inclusion: Advancing Equity for Women and Girls with Disabilities, Handicap International - Making it Work Initiative, November 2014

- → Initiate / contribute to the discussion about non-discrimination and diversity with relevant implications for the operational level, using the existing fora of BMZ.
- → Discuss development of and doing a participatory disability, gender and diversity audit (for example within the new BMZ Gender Action Plan) or a participatory analysis of discrimination (between GIZ, BMZ representatives, and person with and without disabilities engaged) of key departments of the BMZ to identify facilitators, barriers, strengths and gaps. The results will then feed into a detailed action plan for diversity, with detailed actions to address disability and gender related barriers and gaps.
- → Invest resources in changing from a specific approach centered on one single issue ("disability", "gender", "poverty, etc.) to applying a systematic diversity, with disaggregation by gender and disability approach that aims at diversity mainstreaming.
- → The BMZ published framework documents that concern gender<sup>270</sup> as well as disability<sup>271</sup>. But both documents do not address the intersection and do not link their respective programs, approaches and tools to the discussion about non-discrimination and diversity. Any revision of these publication offers the possibility of introducing the missing other concept, as well intersectionality of discrimination and equality.

# Budgeting, m&e:

- → Where possible: Promote and stimulate diversity, i.e. disability and gender-sensitive disability budgeting with the allocation of German funding as possible entry points. Gender-funds should include a disability component; correspondingly disability-funds should clearly declare gender considerations. Other options offer Global Funds on HIV, TB and malaria, with promoting the design of gender, disability and diversity disaggregation sets of indicators.
- → In link with the budgeting is the possibility of a serious engagement in monitoring: For Germany, being one of the major donors of the OECD on gender equality and women empowerment today<sup>272</sup>, to engage in monitoring on gender and/or spearhead disability considerations to the OECD, appears to have a great potential for addressing the intersection of gender and disability more systematically and efficiently. Another opportunity may be the UN Women Trust Fund: given its visibility, and should Germany provide funding or have any other leverage to the trust fund, monitoring done in line with the OECD indicators, would be a helpful approach, to redress action towards the intersection between gender and disability.

#### Multi-lateral aid:

- → Enhance collaboration with other bilateral donors, such as Australian Aid and DFID for strengthening a community of donors on gender, disability and diversity for effectively promoting the issue towards other bilateral and/or multilateral actors.
- → Ensure that the intersection of gender and disability with a diversity approach is a cross-cutting human rights issue in multilateral aid instruments; non-project assistance in the form of sector-wide approaches (SWAPs) or other forms of direct budgetary support (DBS) to national governments connected to Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs); the need for "upstreaming disability issues" in country programming and in development interventions<sup>273</sup>.

# The Post 2015 sustainable development agenda:

→ The MDGs left discriminated groups on the margins of development. Facing their deadline in 2015, a vivid international discussion revolves around the key issues of a post-2015 development framework;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>270</sup> Gleichberechtigung der Geschlechter in der deutschen Entwicklungspolitik (Gender Equality in German Development Cooperation). Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung (BMZ), Strategiepapier 2 / 2014

Action Plan for the Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities (2013 – 2015), Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung (BMZ). Strategy Paper, 1/2013e

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>272</sup> Aid in Support of Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment - Donor Charts. OECD, 2014

Mainstreaming disability in development: Lessons from gender mainstreaming. Disability KaR Programme DFID, 2005, p. 41

"disability inclusion" figures among them acknowledging the total absence of disability in the existing MDG framework as a discriminatory oversight. The new set of Sustainable Development Goals that is currently being negotiated will have to take up the challenge of addressing rising inequalities and discrimination. Strategies and related information monitoring systems therefore need to address patterns of exclusion simultaneously, making key previously overseen notions such as disability more visible in the goals on gender, health, education, work, protection and data.

# 9.2 Recommendations addressing the operational level

#### Research and data collection

- → Initiate a wider study on lessons learned from gender mainstreaming to disability (a follow up from KaR 2005<sup>274</sup>). Possible collaboration: DFID and / or the UN as the UN GA report recommends that the UN may consider facilitating a review on what has been achieved by gender mainstreaming in development, and find out the lessons learned for disability. The study could start with a review of GIZ supported programs or through a Making-it-Work initiative.
- → Support some pilot projects providing means and incentives to global gender stakeholders to mainstream disability comprehensively (i.e. UN Women).
- → Finance a study on the intersection of gender and disability within one specific field (i.e. to learn from education, as most advanced, or sub-sectors in health) within one or two selected countries: analysis of diversity related, with focus on gender and disability gaps, documentation on good practices and lessons learned, including case studies/testimonies of country/projects.

#### Discrimination and diversity

- → The results of the GIZ gender analysis<sup>275</sup> of the Sector Programme "Inclusion of persons with disabilities" show that the team of the Sector Programme "Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities" already disposes of a considerable gender awareness and sensitivity. It still needs to define the specific significance of gender mainstreaming within daily work. This decision will influence also the commitment of the team concerning its implication in the discussion on discrimination and diversity.
- → Develop cross sector recommendations and guidance on diversity: disability, age and gender (and other factors) disaggregation for future action in research, statistic collections and/or monitoring and evaluation. Those should be inclusive of recommendations and guidance on how to partner with men and women with and without disabilities, of different age groups and their representative organizations for any research and/or M&E work.
- → Follow up on the Human Rights and gender inclusion monitoring by OECD, to identify successful practices and check for transfer possibility to disability; see for potential to develop similar tool sets for monitoring the obligations of DAC States on disability inclusion in Development and Humanitarian Action with a focus on key global actors like UNICEF (Germany is funder) to promote more coherent disability and gender mainstreaming on all levels.

# **Training**

→ Develop small and simple training modules on the intersection of gender and disability and / or diversity mainstreaming to be integrated into already existing modules and formats addressing professionals specialised in gender as well as other sectors. Include an individual action plan and do a systematic follow-up of training results.

## Operational advice

27

Disability, Poverty and the Millennium Development Goals: Relevance, Challenges and Opportunities for DFID. Disability KaR Programme DFID, GB 2005

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>275</sup> GIZ Gender Analysis of the Sector Programme "Inclusion of persons with disabilities", Handicap International, October 2014, p. 14

- → Link with GIZ and KfW sectors in education, work / employment & social protection, health and in sexual and gender based violence and consider doing a participatory diversity, focused on disability and gender audit (between GIZ / KfW representatives, and person with and without disabilities engaged) of these departments to identify facilitators, barriers, strengths and gaps. The results will then feed into a detailed action plan for diversity, disability and gender mainstreaming.
- → Identify entry points within the project cycle: gender-sensitive disability analysis, gender- and disability sensitive planning, m&e, etc.
- → Country level: Support the analysis of the CEDAW and the national gender policies (and / or the CRC) in countries that did not yet ratify the UNCRPD or struggle with its implementation in order to benefit from this experience. Support within governance and human rights, and sector specific programing support for governments on disability and gender inclusive national planning processes in bilateral action.
- → Budgeting, m&e: Promote and stimulate diversity, i.e. gender and disability-sensitive budgeting with the allocation of German funding as possible entry points. Gender-funds should include a disability component; correspondingly disability-funds should respect gender issues.
- → Link with relevant representative organisations.

## Exchange and cooperation within GIZ and KfW

- → GIZ / KfW gender team: exchange and discussion about the diversity approach, and a concrete way forwards utilizing the upcoming shift from MDGs to Post MDGs.
- → GIZ / KfW gender representative: learning from experiences concerning the implication of the (male) environment into women's specific empowerment.
- ightarrow Cooperation with the GIZ KC Change Management.
- → Link with "poverty" and "age" representatives / units.

# **Annexes**

- 1. Terms of Reference
- 2. Examples concerning the gender gap in disability
- 3. The intersection of gender and disability within the UNCRPD
- 4. Examples of gender-segregated disability research and statistics
- 5. Bibliography

#### 1. Terms of Reference

Terms of reference for a study on activities focusing the intersection of gender equality and disability inclusion in development cooperation and the performance of an internal gender analysis

(PN 2012.2121.7-001.00)

#### 1. The overall objectives of the assignment

The consulting agency shall:

- Illustrate and analyze (desk study) activities of international development cooperation tackling the interface of gender equality and disability inclusion to inform German development cooperation (GDC); and
- ii. Perform a gender analysis --- based on the requirements and standards set by the GIZ Gender-Analysis --- to evaluate the relevance of gender within the activities, objectives and impacts of the sector project Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities.

#### 2. Background and rationale

To date, disabilities and gender, as socio-structural attributes and basis for multiple discrimination, have been studied almost isolated. Almost no data and rare literature exists focusing on the differences in lived experiences by women and men with disabilities. Furthermore, only few projects so far tackle barriers in this regard.

The UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (UNCRPD) has been ratified by the German Government in 2009. Article 32 of the UNCRPD, with its specific focus on international development cooperation, calls upon member states to realize international cooperation in an equal and inclusive manner. The Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ) has developed an action plan accordingly to ensure the inclusion of persons with disabilities in measures and achievements accomplished by the GDC.

Although, important steps towards equality and an inclusive society have been made over the last years, there are still many people with disabilities, especially women and girls, who are left behind in development processes and have lesser opportunities (e.g. access to information, education, the level of participation in civil society movements or political decision making processes, access to the labour market, etc.).

The GIZ sector project Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities has been commissioned by the BMZ to improve the inclusion of persons with disabilities in strategies and programs within German development cooperation. Its activities in particular focus at four different levels:

- iii. Advising the BMZ;
- iv. Advising / supporting the implementation of inclusive activities in partner countries;
- developing methods and innovative approaches to improve the inclusion of persons with disabilities;
- vi. sensitization and human capacity development.

The present study will be a contribution to developing methods and tools to effectively include persons with disabilities in GDC.

The results and recommendations of the study will be used to design sector specific orientation guides for the implementation of technical and financial cooperation.

#### 3. Deliverables

The consulting agency is expected to:

- i. Deliver a study of max 30 pages in English. This study shall exemplify/illustrate practice examples from international development cooperation focusing on the interface of gender equality and disability inclusion. Followed by an analysis of the illustrated practice examples with consequential recommendations. Hence the above described study shall inform professionals working within GDC on the following areas:
  - Fields of action affected by gender equality and disability inclusion;
  - Methods, which could be adapted by GDC;
  - Existing obstacles and gaps for activities focusing both gender equality and disability inclusion; and
  - Stakeholders and networks, which could be strategic to improve gender equality and disability inclusion within activities of GDC.
- Conduct a gender analysis --- on basis of the requirements and standards set by the GIZ Gender-Analysis --- to evaluate the relevance of gender within the sector projects work, objectives, and impacts.

#### 4. Specific tasks

The consulting agency will develop the study and the GIZ Gender-Analysis by means of the specific tasks listed below. For the GIZ Gender analysis please also refer to requirements and standards as set by the GIZ: <a href="http://www.giz.de/expertise/downloads/EN-FAQ\_Gender\_Analysis.pdf">http://www.giz.de/expertise/downloads/EN-FAQ\_Gender\_Analysis.pdf</a>.

#### 5. Monitoring and reporting

The consulting agency is expected to report to the team of the GIZ sector project Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities. Throughout the whole process the consultant will be advised and supported by the team of the sector project Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities.

#### 6. Timeframe and remuneration

The consultant will commence to work from 01 May 2014. The draft report should be submitted latest by mid July. The final report should be submitted not later than 31 August 2014. The consultant is encouraged to prioritize tasks according to the set timeline (see below).

The extent of work will be about 30 working days. This shall include at least two consultations with the sector project Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities at GIZ headquarters in Eschborn as well as one status report and one final presentation of findings.

#### 7. Required qualifications and experience

To accomplish the specified tasks, GIZ expects the consulting agency to provide the following qualifications and expertise:

- An advanced university degree in economics, development, social science or a related discipline for the principal expert;
- Excellent understanding of GDC;
- Proven extensive knowledge of the international debate on human rights, disability inclusive development and gender issues in international development;
- Cooperation experience on the implementation level;
- Excellent command of the English language (understanding of the German language is a plus).

# 8. Timeline and specific tasks

#	Specific tasks	Expected extend of work (days)
i. Desk study on gender and disability		
1.	Hold initial meeting within the team of the sector project Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities	1
2.	Propose the structure of the study	1/2
3.	Identify key-questions	1/2
4.	Review <u>literature</u> tackling the interface of gender and disability	2
5.	Develop an annotated list with relevant <u>national and international laws</u> , <u>policies and standards</u> regarding gender and disability	2
6.	Map <u>international and national stakeholders</u> which work explicitly on the interface of gender and disability	4
7.	P <u>ropose examples for analysis</u> and collate <u>promising and challenging</u> <u>projects and practices</u>	4
8.	Collate <u>different methodological approaches</u> towards gender and disability equality in international development cooperation	5
9.	Develop a <u>draft report</u>	5
10.	Presentation of the <u>draft</u> within a small group of colleagues from GIZ and working within GDC	1
11.	Incorporate comments and develop final draft	1
12.	Finalize report	2
ii. Gender analysis		
13.	Conduct a gender analysis	2
Grand total		30 days

Ingar Düring

Eschborn, April 2014

# 2. Examples concerning the gender gap in disability

- → The World Report on Disability presents gender-segregated data of education outcomes for disabled and not disabled respondents in 51 countries analysed that show a clear inequity between male and female students. <sup>276</sup> It also states that "the correlations for both children and adults between low educational outcomes and having a disability is often stronger than the correlations between low educational outcome and other characteristics such as gender, rural residence, and low economic status (...)."
- → Statistics of **Jordan** show exemplary that "the **illiteracy rate** for women with physical disabilities is the most alarming figure, at 49.0 per cent of the female population with disabilities (amounting to 3,877 women with physical disabilities), and is therefore significantly higher than the level of illiteracy rates among the national population, at 9.3 per cent, and among men with physical disabilities, at 22.7 per cent (amounting to 3,328 men with physical disabilities)."
- → The **World Health Survey** analyses 51 countries and presents employment rates of 52.8% for men with disability, 19.6% for women with disability, compared with 64.9% for non-disabled men, and 29.9% for non-disabled women. <sup>279</sup>
- → The **costs of exclusion** and the gains of disability inclusion on a general level and more specifically on the level of women and girls with disabilities are another stake at risk. The World Report on Disability confirms that "the economic and social costs of disability are significant, but difficult to quantify."<sup>280</sup> Consequently, no reliable data exists concerning specifically the costs of excluding girls and women with disabilities<sup>281</sup>. But as their discrimination in respect to employment is demonstrated in the paragraph above, it is safe to assume that for this reason the costs of their exclusion and the gains of their inclusion are higher compared to that of men with disabilities.
- → The difference between women with and without disabilities is especially significant concerning the access to **sexual and reproductive health**: "Women with disabilities are not only less likely to receive general information on sexual and reproductive health and are less likely to have access to family planning services, but should they become pregnant, they are also less likely than their non-disabled peers to have access to prenatal, labour and delivery and post-natal services." <sup>282</sup>
- → "In certain regions of the world, households spend less on women's health than on men's, given that women's social status is often inferior to that of men and that they have little opportunity to make decisions. Moreover, women with disabilities are among the poorest in the world." <sup>283</sup> "They also relate to many women's lack of education, which makes them unable to gauge their need for care."
- → Sexual and reproductive health education (SRH): "In many societies, while women receive instruction about SRH either at home or in school, young men are left to pick up information "on the streets" casually, through other men's comments, jokes and innuendoes. Young men with disabilities are often

 $<sup>^{276}</sup>$  World Report on Disability, 2011, p. 207: Table 7.1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>277</sup> World Report on Disability, 2011, p. 206

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>278</sup> Mapping Inequity: Persons with Physical Disabilities in Jordan. United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Western Asia, 2010, page 38

World Health Survey (<a href="http://www.who.int/healthinfo/survey/en">http://www.who.int/healthinfo/survey/en</a>) as cited IN: World Report on Disability, 2011, p.237

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>280</sup> World Report on Disability, 2011, p.42: It lists the "cost of productivity losses because of disability, the cost of lost taxes because of non-employment or reduced employment of disabled people, the cost of health care, social protection, and labour market programmes, and the cost of reasonable accommodation."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>281</sup> World Report on Disability, 2011, p.42

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>282</sup> Promoting sexual and reproductive health for persons with disabilities. World Health Organisation / UNFPA, 2009, p. 10

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>283</sup> A step forward to the social inclusion of girls and women with disabilities in the Middle East - Multifaceted challenges and combined responses, Handicap International, 2014, p. 26

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>284</sup> "Gender Inequalities in Health Care," Gender and Health: Technical Paper, World Health Organisation, 2004

- shielded from even this information, unreliable and incomplete as it may be. Young men with mental and intellectual impairments are particularly likely to be deprived of SRH information."<sup>285</sup>
- → "Being young and a girl/woman puts a person with disability at increased risk of SGBV" 286
- ightarrow There is a high **HIV prevalence** among persons with disabilities with a gradient of risk among women with disabilities. <sup>287</sup>
- → The **UNICEF Fact Sheet** states that "(...) girls with disabilities are less likely to marry (...)<sup>288</sup> resulting in social exclusion and poverty.
- → Increasingly sexual and gender based violence (SGBV) becomes an important issue in the international discussion as the violation of human rights here is the most flagrant: "Being young and a girl/woman puts a person with disability at increased risk of SGBV". 289 UNFPA estimates that persons with disabilities are up to three times more likely to be victims of physical and sexual abuse and rape. 290 "A recent UNICEF report shows that in Taiwan the number of children with mild developmental disabilities in sex work was six times higher than the number of children without disabilities". 291

<sup>285</sup> Promoting sexual and reproductive health for persons with disabilities. World Health Organisation/UNFPA, 2009, n 11

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>286</sup> An assessment of the factors of risk and vulnerability of women and men with disabilities to sexual and gender-based violence, Handicap International Rwanda, Satellite Document, Research and Studies Collection, 2012, p.9

Disability and HIV: a systematic review and a meta-analysis of the risk of HIV infection among adults with disabilities in Sub-Saharan Africa. Pierre De Beaudrap, Muriel Mac-Seing & Estelle Pasquier, 2014

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>288</sup> Children and Young People with Disabilities, UNICEF Fact Sheet, 2013, p.19

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>289</sup> An assessment of the factors of risk and vulnerability of women and men with disabilities to sexual and gender-based violence, Handicap International Rwanda, Satellite Document, Research and Studies Collection, 2012, p.9

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>290</sup> Disability Rights, Gender, and Development. A Resource Tool for Action. WCW, 2008. Part 2, page 9

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>291</sup> Rangita de Silva de Alwis, Child Marriage and the Law, Legislative Reform Initiative Paper Series. New York: UNICEF, January 2008, as cited IN: Addressing gender equality in the context of disability, Inputs from UN Women, page 1/2

# 3. The intersection of gender and disability within the UNCRPD

Several parts of the UNCRPD explicitly address women and girls with disabilities or do include a reference to gender or sex, specifically the preamble and articles 3, 6, 16 and 28:

#### **Preamble**

(q) Recognizing that women and girls with disabilities are often at greater risk, both within and outside the home, of violence, injury or abuse, neglect or negligent treatment, maltreatment or exploitation,

#### **Article 3 - General Principles**

The principles of the present Convention shall be...

g. Equality between men and women;

#### **Article 6 - Women with Disabilities**

- 1. States Parties recognize that women and girls with disabilities are subject to multiple discrimination, and in this regard shall take measures to ensure the full and equal enjoyment by them of all human rights and fundamental freedoms.
- 2. States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to ensure the full development, advancement and empowerment of women, for the purpose of guaranteeing them the exercise and enjoyment of the human rights and fundamental freedoms set out in the present Convention.

## Article 16 - Freedom from Exploitation, Violence and Abuse

- 1. States Parties shall take all appropriate legislative, administrative, social, educational and other measures to protect persons with disabilities, both within and outside the home, from all forms of exploitation, violence and abuse, including their gender-based aspects.
- 2. States Parties shall also take all appropriate measures to prevent all forms of exploitation, violence and abuse by ensuring, inter alia, appropriate forms of gender and age-sensitive assistance and support for persons with disabilities and their families and caregivers, including through the provision of information and education on how to avoid, recognize and report instances of exploitation, violence and abuse. States Parties shall ensure that protection services are age-, gender- and disability-sensitive.
- 4. States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to promote the physical, cognitive and psychological recovery, rehabilitation and social reintegration of persons with disabilities who become victims of any form of exploitation, violence or abuse, including through the provision of protection services. Such recovery and reintegration shall take place in an environment that fosters the health, welfare, self-respect, dignity and autonomy of the person and takes into account gender- and age-specific needs.
- 5. States Parties shall put in place effective legislation and policies, including women and child-focused legislation and policies, to ensure that instances of exploitation, violence and abuse against persons with disabilities are identified, investigated and, where appropriate, prosecuted.

#### Article 28 - Adequate standard of living and social protection

(...)

(...)

2. States Parties recognize the right of persons with disabilities to social protection and to the enjoyment of that right without discrimination on the basis of disability, and shall take appropriate steps to safeguard and promote the realization of this right, including measures:

(...)

(b) To ensure access by persons with disabilities, in particular women and girls with disabilities and older persons with disabilities, to social protection programmes and poverty reduction programmes;

# 4. Examples of gender-segregated disability research and statistics

- → Existing activities and initiatives: Disability and gender inclusive research and statistics are part of one of the three objectives of the WHO global disability action plan (2014 2021).
- → It seems likely that the post MDG 2015 framework will be inclusive of disability disaggregated data collection, since there is a broad campaign between DFID, IDDC, IDA and others proposing a "data revolution" for including disability, gender and age disaggregated data collection into the Post MDG framework<sup>292</sup>.
- → The latest UN GA report on disability recommends to A) mainstreaming disability (acknowledging the issue as a challenge, where more needs to be done and will be done) and B) data collection (disaggregation and inclusion of baseline data for post MDG monitoring into census, needing more impetus and work)<sup>293</sup>.
- → The Tanzania 2008 **Disability Survey Report**<sup>294</sup> shows gender-segregated data on disability on a national level.
- → The research-training-action initiative of the regional **project LEAD**<sup>295</sup> Funded by the US Middle-East-Partnership-Initiative (MEPI), implemented in partnership with Handicap International (Leadership and Empowerment for Action on Disability) took place in three countries of the Maghreb (Morocco, Tunisia, Algeria) from 2012 to 2014<sup>296</sup>. The research project was carried out in the three countries over a period of approximately 10 months in total, including field work in each country and the production of national research papers<sup>297</sup>. The research project focused on gender issues as a cross-cutting theme for all aspects of the analysis and used a participatory approach involving persons with disabilities and Disabled People's Organizations at all levels. They facilitated the data collection and the mobilization of individuals to ensure that the study reflects the views and experiences of individuals and grassroots organizations. 600 persons with disabilities and family members were directly consulted during the research project. The three final reports will be published end of December 2014;
- → Specific gender-segregated data on the diversity of disability exist in several publications;<sup>298</sup>
- → EuropeAid Development and Cooperation (EU **DEVCO**) encourages country programs to analyse the situation based on disability and gender disaggregated data<sup>299</sup>.
- → **Irish GBV** consortium recommends the disaggregation of any data in GBV responses by disability, and other marginalizing factors<sup>300</sup>.
- → **BMZ** supported applied research projects on Inclusion and social protection and inclusive education

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>292</sup> Disability Framework - Leaving No One Behind. Department for International Development (DfID), UK 2014

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>293</sup> UN GA report on disability, 2014

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>294</sup> Tanzania 2008 Disability Survey Report. Tanzania Bureau of Statistics, 2009

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>295</sup> Funded by the US Middle-East-Partnership-Initiative (MEPI), implemented in partnership with Handicap International

<sup>296</sup> http://www.maghrebhandicap.com/index.php/a-propos/projet-lead

<sup>297</sup> http://www.maghrebhandicap.com/index.php/component/content/article/9-uncategorised/133-la-recherche

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>298</sup> Hidden in Plain Sight: A statistical analysis of violence against children. United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF), 2014. National Disability Assessment: Eastern Equatoria, Jonglei, & Western Bahr el-Ghazal States. Forcier consulting for MGCSW, 2012. Out from the shadows. Sexual Violence against children with disabilities. Handicap International, 2011. Rapid Needs Assessment. Situation of children, youth and adults with disabilities, within and around Domiz. Handicap International, Northern Iraq 2013. Sexual and gender-based violence against women and girls with disabilities. First Facts from Dadaab Refugee Camps. # 1. Handicap International, 2013.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>299</sup> Disability-inclusive development cooperation. Guidance note for EU Staff. EUROPAID, 2012, p.6

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>300</sup> Irish Consortium on Gender Based Violence: Gender Based Violence in the post MDG 2015 Agenda. 2012, p.9

# 5. Bibliography

#### **African Union**

African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights 1986

#### **African Union**

African Union Gender Policy. 2008

#### **African Union**

Continental Plan of Action for the African Decade of Persons with Disabilities 2010 – 2019. 2010

#### **African Union**

Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women In Africa Maputo / Mozambique, 2003

#### **African Union**

The African Women's Decade. Theme: Grassroots Approach to Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment (GEWE) 2011

# **Asian Development Bank**

Tool kit on gender equality results and indicators. Financed by Australian Aid Mandaluyong City, Philippines, 2013

## **Australian Agency For International Development**

AusAID Annual Report 2012-2013

# Behinderung und Dritte Welt, Journal for Disability and International Development

Schwerpunktthema: Frauen mit Behinderungen in der internationalen Frauenrechtsarbeit und Behindertenbewegung 20. Jahrgang, Ausgabe 3/2009

#### Behinderung und Entwicklungszusammenarbeit e.V. (bezev)

Guideline for the inclusion of persons with disabilities in development cooperation 2011

# Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung (BMZ)

Aktionsplan zur Inklusion von Menschen mit Behinderung, Strategiepapier Action Plan for the Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities (2013 – 2015), Strategy Paper 1/2013e 2013

## Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung (BMZ)

Gleichberechtigung der Geschlechter in der deutschen Entwicklungspolitik (Gender Equality in German Development Cooperation). Übersektorales Konzept. Strategiepapier 2 / 2014

## Carr-Hill, Roy

"High Level Panel's Recommendation for a New Data Revolution", IN: Education and Development in the Post-2015 Landscapes, NORRAG NEWS 49

UK, October 2013, p. 110/111

# Christofel-Blindenmission and the International Centre for Evidence in Disability, London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine / Morgon-Banks, Lena and Polack, Sarah

The Economic Costs of Exclusion and Gains of Inclusion of People with disabilities. Evidence from Low and Middle Income Countries

London / UK, 2014

## Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, Centre for Disability, Law and Policy

Gender-based violence against women with psychosocial and intellectual disabilities in South Africa: Promoting access to justice.

April 2013

#### **Council of the European Union**

Council conclusions on a transformative post-2015 agenda Brussels / Belgium, December 2014

# **Council of the European Union**

Council conclusions on the European Pact for gender equality for the period 2011 - 2020 2011

#### **CRPD Committee**

Concluding observations on Spain, Hungary, Tunisia, Peru, China, Paraguay, Argentina: <a href="http://tb.ohchr.org/default.aspx">http://tb.ohchr.org/default.aspx</a>

# De Beaudrap, Pierre ; Mac-Seing, Muriel & Pasquier, Estelle

Disability and HIV: a systematic review and a meta-analysis of the risk of HIV infection among adults with disabilities in Sub-Saharan Africa

2014

#### Department for International Development (DfID)

Disability Framework - Leaving No One Behind UK, December 2014

#### Disability KaR Programme DfID / Philippa Thomas

Disability, Poverty and the Millennium Development Goals: Relevance, Challenges and Opportunities for DFID.

GB 2005

# Disability KaR Programme DfID / Miller, Carol and Albert, Bill

Mainstreaming disability in development: Lessons from gender mainstreaming. March 2005

#### **Disability Monitor Initiative-Middle East**

http://www.hiproweb.org/uploads/tx\_hidrtdocs/AccessSocialServicesDMI2009.pdf

Access to Social Services for Persons with Disabilities in the Middle East - Multi-stakeholder reflections for policy reform

2009

# **Disabled People's International (DPI)**

http://www.dpi.org/DurbanDeclaration

Durban Declaration 2011

#### **EUROPAID**

Disability-inclusive development cooperation Guidance note for EU Staff 2012

## **European Commission**

Report on the implementation of the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD) by the European Union. Commission staff working document Brussels / Belgium, June 2014

#### **European Commission**

Strategy for equality between women and men 2010-2015 2010

#### **European Union**

Discrimination generated by the intersection of gender and disability 2013

## **Forcier consulting for MGCSW**

National Disability Assessment: Eastern Equatoria, Jonglei, & Western Bahr el-Ghazal States. 2012

## Frohmader, Carolyn and Ortoleva, Stephanie

The Sexual and Reproductive Rights of Women and Girls with Disabilities Issues Paper 2013

## Gesellschaft für Interationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ)

Gender pays off! Gender Strategy. Eschborn, Germany 2012

# Gesellschaft für Interationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ)

Programmvorschlag Sektorvorhaben Inklusion von Menschen mit Behinderungen, überregional, PN 2012.2121.7

Eschborn / Germany, 2012

# Gesellschaft für Interationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) / Sector Programme "Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities"

Terms of reference for a study on activities focusing the intersection of gender equality and disability inclusion in development cooperation and the performance of an internal gender analysis (PN 2012.2121.7-001.00)

Eschborn / Germany, 2014

# **Handicap International**

Good Practices for the Economic Inclusion of People with Disabilities in Developing Countries: Funding Mechanisms for Self-Employment.

http://www.handicap-international.org/uploads/media/goodpractices-GB-2coul.PDF 2006

#### **Handicap International**

Handicap International Gender Projects at a Glance

# **Handicap International**

Out from the shadows. Sexual Violence against children with disabilities. 2011

#### **Handicap International**

Rapid Needs Assessment. Situation of children, youth and adults with disabilities, within and around Domiz. Northern Iraq 2013

## **Handicap International**

Sexual and gender-based violence against women and girls with disabilities. First Facts from Dadaab Refugee Camps. # 1.

financed by BPRM and Swiss Solidarity (CdB)

2013

## **Handicap International**

The Status of Rights of Persons with Disabilities in Tanzania.

Project: "Harambee Ya Uhuru Na Umoja, From Rights to Inclusion in Kenya and Tanzania" July 2014

# **Handicap International**

Understanding factors contributing to Gender Based Violence towards Persons with Disabilities in Dadaab refugee camp

GBV & Disability Consultancy Report financed by BPRM and Swiss Solidarity (CdB)

2013

# Handicap International / Legoff, Stéphanie

A step forward to the social inclusion of girls and women with disabilities in the Middle East - Multifaceted challenges and combined responses 2014

#### Handicap International / Mac-Seing, Muriel and Boggs, Dorothy

Gender and disability violence and HIV and AIDS: Triple discrimination against women and girls with disabilities.

2014

## Handicap International / Mac-Seing, Muriel

Inclusive and integrated HIV and AIDS programming.
<a href="http://www.hiproweb.org/uploads/tx\_hidrtdocs/PP07\_06\_light.pdf">http://www.hiproweb.org/uploads/tx\_hidrtdocs/PP07\_06\_light.pdf</a>
2012

# Handicap International / Pierre, Agnès

Gender Handbook Lyon / France 2009

#### Handicap International / Ziegler, Stefanie

GIZ Gender Analysis of the Sector Programme "Inclusion of persons with disabilities" Munich / BRD, October 2014

#### **Handicap International - Making it Work Initiative**

Gender and Disability Inclusion: Advancing Equity for Women and Girls with Disabilities, November 2014

# **Handicap International - Making it Work Initiative**

How can Disabled Women's Organisations participate in decision-making processes? Good Practice case study Niger, <a href="http://www.makingitwork-crpd.org/good-practice-database/search-the-good-practice-database/db/CaseStudy/show/how-can-disabled-womens-organisations-participate-in-decision-making-processes/">http://www.makingitwork-crpd.org/good-practice-database/search-the-go

#### **Handicap International Rwanda**

An assessment of the factors of risk and vulnerability of women and men with disabilities to sexual and gender-based violence

Satellite Document, Research and Studies Collection

Rwanda / France 2012

#### **Handicap International & CESVI**

Children with Disabilities in Somaliland: A knowledge, attitudes and practices household survey. with the support of the EC Hargeisa / Somaliland 2013

## **Handicap International & MIUSA**

Module on gender and disability in development 2013

#### **Handicap International & MIUSA**

Handicap International's contribution in response to the consultation organised by the Office of the High Commissioner on Human Rights (OHCHR) on the Thematic Study on Participation of Persons with Disabilities in Political and Public Life, based on a the resolution HRC /16/L20 (March 2011), for consideration at the 19th session of the Human Rights Council, March 2012.

# Handicap International and United Disabled Persons of Kenya (UDPK)

Fact Sheet – The Status of Rights of Persons with disabilities in Kenya. 2014

# **Human Rights Watch**

One Billion Forgotten. Protecting the human rights of Persons with Disabilities. 2011

## **Inclusion International**

Fact sheet on poverty and disability. 2005

#### **International Alliance of Women**

Action Programme (2014-2016)
<a href="http://womenalliance.org/action-program">http://womenalliance.org/action-program</a>
2014

#### **International Alliance of Women**

International Alliance of Women. Equal rights – equal responsibilities constitution Revised 2010

#### International Disability Alliance (IDA) / IDDC

Make the post-MDG framework inclusive of persons with disabilities. 2014

## International Disability Alliance (IDA)

Nairobi Declaration inclusive Post 2015 Development Agenda for Persons with disabilities in Africa. 2014

#### **International Labour Organization**

Count us in! How to make sure that women with disabilities can participate effectively in mainstream women's entrepreneurship development activities 2008

#### **International Labour Organization**

Disability Discrimination at Work Fact Sheet 2008

#### **International Labour Organization**

Global Employment Trends 2012. Preventing a deeper jobs crisis. Geneva, 2012

## **International Labour Organization**

The employment situation of people with disabilities: towards improved statistical information. Geneva, 2007

#### **International Labour Organization**

World Social Protection Report. Building economic recovery, inlusive development and social justice. 2014-2015.

http://www.ilo.org/global/research/global-reports/world-social-security-report/2014/WCMS 245201/lang-en/index.htm

2014

# International Network of Women with disabilities (INWWD)

15-Year Review of the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action. Comments from The International Network Of Women With Disabilities.

 $\underline{\text{http://inwwd.wordpress.com/publications-of-the-inwwd/}}$ 

2010

#### International Network of Women with disabilities (INWWD)

Interdependence: Including Women with Disabilities in the Agenda of the Women's Movement -- Our Fears, Realities, Hopes, and Dreams.

http://inwwd.wordpress.com/publications-of-the-inwwd/

2012

# Irish Consortium on Gender Based Violence

www.gbv.ie

Gender Based Violence in the post MDG 2015 Agenda. Research Report. 2012

## Lao People's Democratic Republic

Decree on Persons with Disabilities

https://dredf.org/international/LPDR1.doc

## Meekosha, Helen

Gender and disability

(Draft entry for the forthcoming Sage Encyclopaedia of Disability written in 2004)

# **Mobility International USA (MIUSA)**

Building an Inclusive Development Community. A Manual on Including People with Disabilities in International Development Programs.

2003

# Mobility International USA (MIUSA) / Tina L. Singleton, Project Coordinator Report by Tina L. Singleton, Mary Lou Breslin, Cindy Lewis and Robert L. Metts, Ph.D

Gender and Disability: A Survey of InterAction Member Agencies. Findings and Recommendations on Inclusion of Women and Men with Disabilities in International Development Programs. 2002

# Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)

Aid in Support of Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment 2010

## Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)

Aid in Support of Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment - Donor Charts. 2014

## Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)

Aid in Support of Gender Equality in Fragile and Conflict-affected States. <a href="https://www.oecd.org/dac/stats/gender">www.oecd.org/dac/stats/gender</a>
2010

# Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)

Findings from the Gender Equality Module of the 2011 Paris Declaration Monitoring Survey. <a href="https://www.oecd.org/dac/gender">www.oecd.org/dac/gender</a>
2011.

# **Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)**

Integrating Human rights in Development. Donor Approaches, experiences and challenges.  $2^{nd}$  edition 2013

# **OXFAM / Alison Harris with Sue Enfield**

An Oxfam Publication in association with Action on Disability and Development (ADD) Disability, Equality and Human Rights. A Training Manual for Development and Humanitarian Organisations.

UK 2003

# **OXFAM**

Close the Gap. How to Eliminate Violence Against Women beyond 2015. 2014

# **OXFAM**

Even it up. Time to End Extreme Inequality. 2014

## Save the Children and Handicap International

Out from the Shadows. Sexual violence against children with disabilities. UK 2011

# Snyder, Margaret, Ph.D.

Issues in gender-sensitive and disability-responsive policy research, training and action

# **Swedish International Development Cooperation (SIDA)**

Tool: African Conventions, Declarations and Agreements. 2010

#### **Tanzania Bureau of Statistics**

Tanzania 2008 Disability Survey Report. 2009

## **Trickle Up**

Disability, Poverty & Livelihoods Guidance from Trickle Up 2013

## **Trinity College**

EquiFrame: A framework for analysis of the inclusion of human rights and vulnerable groups in health policies.
2011

#### **United Nations**

Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and Optional Protocol 2006

#### **United Nations**

Declaration of women, peace and security 2013

# **United Nations**

Report of the Fourth World Conference on Women Beijing, 1995

#### **United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF)**

Fact Sheet: Children and Young People with Disabilities, May 2013

# **United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF)**

Hidden in Plain Sight: A statistical analysis of violence against children New York / USA, 2014  $\,$ 

# **United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF)**

The UNICEF Strategic Plan, 2014-2017. Realizing the rights of every child, especially the most disadvantaged 2013

# **United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF)**

Final Results framework of the UNICEF Strategic Plan, 2014 - 2017 2014

# **United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF)**

Revised Supplementary Programme Note on the Theory of Change for the UNICEF Strategic Plan, 2014 – 2017 2014

## **United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF)**

UNICEF strategic plan 2014-2017. Brochure. 2014

**United Nations Development Programme** and the UN Office of the Special Adviser on Gender Issues and Advancement of Women / Carolyn Hannan

From concept to action: Gender mainstreaming in operational activities. Assessment of gender mainstreaming and empowerment of women in sub-Saharan Africa. A review of UNDP supported activities New York / USA, 2000

#### **United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Western Asia**

Mapping Inequity: Persons with Physical Disabilities in Jordan 2010

# United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (UN ESCAP)

Incheon Strategy to "Make the Right Real" for Persons with Disabilities in Asia and the Pacific 2012

#### United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO)

Teaching Children with Disabilities in Inclusive Settings. Embracing Diversity: Guide for Creating Inclusive, Learing-friendly Environments. Specialized booklet 3.

Bangkok / Thailand 2009

# **United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO)**

Teaching Children with Disabilities in Inclusive Settings. Embracing Diversity: Toolkit for Creating Inclusive, Learing-friendly Environments. Specialized booklet 3.

Bangkok / Thailand 2009

# United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) / Harilyn Rousso

Education for All: a gender and disability perspective

Background paper\* prepared for the Education for All Global Monitoring Report 2003/4 Gender and Education for All: The Leap to Equality. 2003

#### **United Nations enable**

Fact Sheet on Persons with Disabilities <a href="http://www.un.org/disabilities/default.asp?id=18">http://www.un.org/disabilities/default.asp?id=18</a> 2012?

# **United Nations Trust Fund to End Violence against Women**

Call for Proposals 2013

# **United Nations Women**

Addressing gender equality in the context of disability.

http://www.google.de/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=1&ved=0CCEQFjAA&url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.un.org%2Fdisabilities%2Fdocuments%2Fhlmdd%2Fhlmdd\_unwomen.doc&ei=ocWGVlaKHuX8ygOF1oG4Bg&usg=AFQjCNEngLXSeYmQsXaVqVr6R8lLUCl5Mw&sig2=Y6lGvjP7N8GJpwjct0aGlQ&bvm=bv.81449611,d.d2s

# University of Jyväskylä / Okkolin, Mari-Anne; Lehtomäki, Elina; Bhalalusesa, Eustella

The successful education sector development in Tanzania: Comment on gender balance and inclusive education

**Wellesley Centers for Women** in cooperation with the Secretariat for the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities of the Department of Economic and Social Affairs / United Nations and the United Nations Population Fund;

Disability Rights, Gender, and Development: A Resource Tool for Action. 2008

# **WEEA Equity Resource Center at EDC**

Connecting Gender and Disability USA 1999

# Women Enabled / Stephanie Ortoleva

Beijing Plus 20 Review: The Situation of Women and Girls with Disabilities and The Beijing Plus Twenty Process

2013

#### **Women Watch**

Women with disabilities Fact Sheet: http://www.un.org/womenwatch/enable

#### **World Bank**

http://web.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/TOPICS/EXTSOCIALPROTECTION/EXTDISABILITY/0,,contentMDK:20193528~menuPK:418895~pagePK:148956~piPK:216618~theSitePK:282699,00.html

#### **World Bank**

**Disability Strategy** 

http://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/disability/overview#2

2014

# **World Bank**

**Gender Strategy** 

http://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/gender/overview#2

2014

#### **World Bank**

Management's Discussion & Analysis and Financial Statements. June 30, 2014.

#### **World Bank**

Statement from the World Bank Group at the UN High-Level Meeting of the General Assembly on Disability. <a href="http://www.worldbank.org/en/news/press-release/2013/09/23/statement-from-the-world-bank-group-at-the-un-high-level-meeting-of-the-general-assembly-on-disability">http://www.worldbank.org/en/news/press-release/2013/09/23/statement-from-the-world-bank-group-at-the-un-high-level-meeting-of-the-general-assembly-on-disability</a>
2013

#### **World Bank**

Update on the Implementation of the Gender Equality Agenda at the World Bank Group. 2013

# **World Bank**

Voice and Agency. Empowering women and girls for shared prosperity. 2012

#### **World Bank**

World Development Report. Gender Equality and Development.

#### **World Bank Group**

Corporate Scorecards
October 2014

## **World Health Organisation**

Community Based Rehabilitation - CBR. Introductory Booklet. 2010

# **World Health Organisation**

Disability. Draft WHO global disability action plan 2014–2021: Better health for all people with disability. Report by the Secretariat.

2014

# **World Health Organisation**

Disability and health Factsheet N°352

Reviewed September 2013: http://www.who.int/mediacentre/factsheets/fs352/en/

## **World Health Organisation**

"Gender Inequalities in Health Care," IN: Gender and Health, Technical Paper 2004

#### **World Health Organisation**

Towards a Common Language for Functioning, Disability and Health – The International Classification of Functioning, Disability and Health (ICF)

Geneva / Switzerland 2002

## **World Health Organisation**

WHO global disability action plan 2014–2021: Better health for all people with disability. Report by the Secretariat.

2014

# **World Health Organisation**

World Health Survey 2002 – 2004: <a href="http://www.who.int/healthinfo/survey/en/">http://www.who.int/healthinfo/survey/en/</a>

# **World Health Organisation / JMU**

Prevalence and risk of violence against adults with Disabilities: a systematic review and meta-analysis of observational studies

Lancet 2012

#### World Health Organisation, UNAIDs and OHCHR

Disability and HIV Policy Brief 2009

# World Health Organisation and UNFPA

Promoting sexual and reproductive health for persons with disabilities. Guidance Note

Geneva / Switzerland, 2009

#### **World Health Organisation and World Bank**

World Report on Disability 2011